



## Report of Mr. Justice Frank E. Hodgins in Regard to Chiropractic

The following article on chiropractic is reprinted with permission from the report of the Commissioner appointed in 1915 by the government of the Province of Ontario into all matters relating to the practice of the healing art. This investigation included not only medical education, by which physicians are prepared, but also the practice of osteopaths, optometrists, chiropractors and christian scientists and others professing to practice the healing art. The Commissioner was the Hon. Mr. Justice Frank E. Hodgins of the Supreme Court, Toronto. The investigation was conducted during 1916. In this report Mr. Justice Hodgins states that he visited 14 different cities of Canada and United States and 18 different institutions; he interviewed 234 people and, besides an abundance of direct evidence, collected nearly 200 pamphlets bearing on all phases of the problem. This investigation went thoroughly into the origin, progress and practice of osteopathy, chiropractic, manotherapy, christian science and other forms of healing, as well as medical education, dentistry and nursing. Only the portions relating to chiropractors and its "supporting statement" are reproduced at this time. We have had certain portions set in italics for emphasis.

### MR. JUSTICE HODGINS' REPORT

Of the Canadian Chiropractors' Association the record of its 24 members have been sent to me. None of them have taken courses of more than 2 terms of six months' each. All but 8 have graduated from the Palmer School of Chiropractic, Davenport, Iowa, in 1910, 1911, 1912, 1913 and 1914, and in so doing only took this short course. Of the remaining 8, 3 graduated from colleges now defunct, and one from the National Chiropractic College of Chicago, all of which have or had correspondence courses, and the association therefore declines to vouch for them. The other 4 graduated from the Canadian Chiropractic College in Hamilton, after a course of two terms of six months' each. The number of those in practice in Ontario in June, 1913, was 15.

The Ontario Chiropractors' Association has a membership of 25. Of these, 23 graduated from the Universal School of Chiropractic, Davenport, Iowa, the remaining 2 having studied at the Oklahoma Chiropractic Institute and the Detroit Chiropractic School. Of the 23, 9 took a course of only nine months (three of them spending some time previously at the Palmer Chiropractic College), while 14 took a course lasting twelve months (two attending the Palmer College previously). The remaining 2 took eight and twelve months' courses, respectively. Of the 25, those practicing in Ontario before 1913 numbered 17.

P

615.82

H689

The Dominion Chiropractors' Association has a membership of 18. Of these, 13 graduated from the Palmer School of Chiropractic, all but 4 taking a two-year course, 2 taking 9 months and 2 a three years' course, and one unspecified. Two are graduates of the defunct Robbins Chiropractic College of Sault Ste. Marie, nine months' course, one of the New England School of Chiropractic, and 3 of the Canadian Chiropractic College, Hamilton, taking one year. Of the 18, only 8 were in practice in Ontario in June, 1913.

The education received by chiropractors is of such short duration and so fundamentally different from that of any other school, that it is difficult to regard their desire for legislative recognition as seriously as that of the osteopaths.

As compared with the osteopaths, there is a more marked weakness in numbers, in training and an absolute want of real investment in educational facilities. The equipment of the only existing school is but \$1,200, book value, while the income of the three associations, into which the chiropractors are split, is negligible, as will be seen in the Supporting Statement (also reprinted hereinafter). There is nowhere apparent any desire to approximate either to the regular medical standards or even to those of the osteopaths. This school is quite irreconcilable, as appears from the statements and literature, and any attempt at fusion or cooperation would be quite futile.

Dr. DuVal, who conducts the Canadian Chiropractic College at Hamilton, said to me: "Chiropractic is a unique science. It has nothing in common with any other method, class, school or cult, neither in its science, philosophy, art, doctrine or principles on which it is based."

In accounting for his meager equipment, he said that the essential apparatus necessary to teach chiropractic is brains, hands, knowledge and the ability to impart to the students.

*Their repudiation of all modern scientific knowledge and methods is such that it would be impossible to recommend any way in which they could be allowed to practice by which the public could be safeguarded. Their case was well presented, but was definitely Ishmaelish. Those who appeared before me saw no necessity for preparatory qualifications, ridiculed and repudiated diagnosis, bacteriology and chemistry; admitted that a chiropractor acts in all cases on his cardinal principle, without examination.*

Dr. B. J. Palmer, the head of the most important chiropractic college in the United States, in giving evidence in the case of the State vs. Jansheski, in December, 1910, when asked whether, when a patient came to a chiropractor, he was asked the history of the case, answered: "No, because it be of no value"; and in answer to why that was so, said:

A person comes to us without telling us what the trouble is; it makes no difference whether a physician has already diagnosed it as insanity, appendicitis, indigestion, or anything they call it. The chiropractor needs to know nothing about that case from a physician's standpoint; it is immaterial, yet he can take that case, put it down on his benches and analyze that spine just as accurately without knowing those things; in fact, sometimes I think better. . . . It is not essential the chiropractor should know what the patient said he had, but you can adjust the current for it running into the organ, and the patient is well. That is where chiropractics becomes purely a mechanical proposition, a mechanical and electrical-making circuit proposition in a man.

The definition is put into technical terms by McNamara of the Universal Chiropractic College, Davenport, Iowa, in *Progress* (October, 1912) thus:

The theory sustaining this system presumes that in consequence of displaced vertebra the intervertebral foramina (openings) are occluded (closed), through which the spinal nerves pass. . . . In this way the nerves are pinched, and chiropractors assume that such pinching is responsible for 95 per cent. of all diseases. Chiropractic concerns itself with an adjustment of the subluxations, thus removing the pressure on the nerves.

The announcements of their colleges in the United States frankly appeal to the expected financial returns.

The recommendation made by me as to physical therapy will in part answer a complaint made before me by Dr. Duval, who after stating that bogus schools had produced fake chiropractors in large numbers, put part of the blame for this on the authorities in Canada and the United States who did not, he said, owing to the instigation of the older professions, investigate and protect the science of chiropractic to keep it fine and unadulterated and defend it against its intrinsic enemies, the grafters.

The admission indicates how dangerous it would be to sanction the practice in Ontario of those who adopt the chiropractic belief, unless it is possible to distinguish between fakery and others. This seems impossible to do, if those who practice it are divided as to what is pure and what is adulterated.

I have pointed out in the Supporting Statement (also reprinted herewith) the position taken by those who are at present urging that this school or thought or unique science should be recognized, and what I think is the weakness of that position.

*I cannot bring myself to the point of accepting, as part of our legalized medical provision for the sick, a system which denies the need of diagnosis, refers 95 per cent. of disease to one and the same cause, and turns its back resolutely on all modern medical scientific methods as being founded on nothing and unworthy even to be discussed.*

I may add that Dr. Matson, Secretary of the Ohio State Medical Board, Ohio, stated to me that the Palmer School of Chiropractic refused their Board admission to inspect the school in any official way. This shows the difficulty where the licensing body has no local control over education. In Ohio they have no chiropractic colleges, but regulate, examine and license chiropractors.

#### EXTRACTS FROM THE "SUPPORTING STATEMENT"

There is one school of chiropractic in Ontario, situated in Hamilton. Its equipment is given as of the value of \$1,200 all chattel properly, office furniture, etc. Its receipts from January, 1914, to December, 1915, have been \$8,053 and its expenditures \$6,740.36.

This institution is carried on in rented quarters, being half the ground floor at the old public library building in Hamilton, the rental being \$450 per annum and the insurance \$1,000. It has treated 250 patients, or an average of 12 patients a month, has 25 graduates, and had 14 students in attendance when inspected in December, 1915. Students pay \$250 for the course. Application for incorporation was made in April, 1914, but

was refused by the Provincial Secretary. The course is twelve months, either continuously or two years of six months' each, with no entrance examination or standard. Anatomy is treated as a literary course, and is chiefly devoted to the bony portion of man which comes into direct relation with the passage of important nerves. The staff consists of Ernst DuVal, his wife and son, and Dr. Patterson, a practicing chiropractor, is an honorary member. Three and a half hours in the morning are devoted to lectures, recitations and quiz work, and one and a half hours to clinical instructions on patients who pay \$1 per month.

One of the difficulties in dealing with chiropractic is its exclusive and unusual quality. In the address made before me by Dr. E. DuVal, who conducts the Canadian Chiropractic College in Hamilton, he says:

Chiropractic is a unique science. It has nothing in common with any other method, class, school or cult, neither in its science, philosophy, art, doctrine or principle upon which it is based.

It is essentially natural and self-sufficient in its own sphere.

Chiropractic does not claim to treat, cure or heal anything or anybody of ailments or diseases.

The chiropractor does not concern himself with . . . the consideration of effects: the all-important thing for him is to locate and remove the cause, regardless of the effect.

His definition of chiropractic is in effect that physical interference with the carrying capacity of the nerves is the predisposing cause of disease, and, when the interference is sufficiently severe, the disease itself: that these interferences most often take place in the spinal column; that the locating and removal of these pressures is the removal of the cause of disease, the essential work of the chiropractor; that his highly cultivated sense of touch enables him to appreciate the interferences by palpation, i. e., the act of feeling with the fingers the relations of the vertebrae with each other: that he readjusts the bones and relieves pressure, restoring the harmony between the brain and the tissues and organs of the body.

Dr. DuVal adds:

Fake chiropractors have been produced in large numbers by bogus schools, which for a mere song and in a few weeks' time, even by correspondence, succeed in exploiting the public at the expense and to the detriment of the noblest science ever presented to the world. And owing to this, and in self-defense, genuine schools have been compelled to maintain a minimum course at a minimum cost to sustain themselves in the field of action and to protect the science.

Moreover we place some of the blame on the authorities of both the United States and Canada, who, through the instigation of the older professions, which hold a monopoly of administering to the sick, did not investigate the science of chiropractic sooner and afford it the proper protection to keep it pure and unadulterated, and defend it at least against its intrinsic enemies, the grafters.

As to the curriculum of this college, Dr. DuVal says:

The curriculum of the Canadian Chiropractic College consists of a reliable course in anatomy, sufficiently extensive to enable its graduates to compare favorably with the practitioners of other professions, except those engaged in the actual teaching of this science; a substantial knowledge of practical and established physiology, refraining from entering into the unknown and speculative, which forms the greatest portion of the books; a practical knowledge of symptomatology and diagnosis; rudiments of obstetrics; elementary embryology; the science of chiropractic; the philosophy of chiropractic; the art of chiropractic, which consists of analysis, palpation, adjusting and nerve-tracing, studies that are characteristic of chiropractic differing from all else of the name; a course of two daily lectures and other incidental lectures on chiropractic philosophy and kindred subjects, philosophy being interpreted in both its literal and modern acceptation; the first being the "love of truth and wisdom," and the second "a course of reasoning and argumentation" based on facts relating to the science of chiropractic and natural law.

As to diagnosis, the following explanation is given:

Chiropractors have no earthly use for diagnosis, as such, for the practice of chiropractic is unlike the majority of the other healing professions, to whom diagnosis is a necessity, because of their having to administer the right medicine for the right disease, and therefore it becomes imperative to have a correct diagnosis of the conditions on account of the danger involved in administering the wrong medicine, which might prove disastrous. But it is not so with the chiropractor whose system involves only the removal of the cause of the disease and that being always the same and requiring no dangerous drugs diagnosis, therefore, becomes useless, except that he, as well as others, must know sufficient symptoms and diagnosis for the purpose of differentiating between contagious and noncontagious diseases, not to assist or guide him in his work, but to conform to the laws of the several boards of health, who require that contagious cases be reported, more fully investigated, and, if necessary, isolated.

He scouts bacteriology, materia medica and chemistry as follows:

They would also compel us to study bacteriology. This also is of no value to the chiropractor, who does not consider that it is worth the infinitesimal mites; to group and classify them, count their appendages and try to memorize their names.

We would also be required to learn materia medica. ~~What?~~ <sup>What?</sup>

What on earth could we do with that ponderous knowledge, we who abhor the very name of drugs and repudiate their use? I admit that they consider this study of great value to them, as they have been searching for a long time for an elixir of life and that they still expect to find one.

There is also chemistry, which is a valuable science, but it has nothing in common with chiropractic, and cannot be made an adjunct to it.

As to education, preliminary to admission to his college, Dr. DuVal says:

One important feature of the question of education for chiropractors is that of preparatory qualifications; in other words: What are the "requirements of entrance" necessary to learn chiropractic at the Canadian Chiropractic College? To be truthful, we candidly say that we are not overexigent on "requirements of entrance," but we are most particular in exacting requirements of graduation; we think that of far greater importance.

In his answers to me in Hamilton, Dr. DuVal said that chiropractors do not care whether an organ is diseased or not; they do not examine or treat it, but merely adjust the spinal column and that they act, in any case, on their cardinal principle without examination.

Dr. Palmer, who conducts the principal school of chiropractic, in Davenport, Iowa, was present at one of the sessions of the Commission, and in the course of his address said that he did not teach pathology, except to enable a chiropractor to detect infection and refuse the case. As to bacteriology, he said the chiropractor did not believe in bacteria, and that bacteriology was the greatest of all gigantic forces ever invented for ignorance and incompetency, and as to analysis of blood and urine, he considered it of no value.

An interesting cross-examination of Dr. Palmer, in 1910, in the case of the State v. Jansheski is among the exhibits handed in with my report, and in it will be found many definite statements of the same character. One of these is, that chiropraxy is different from any other theory of disease that he knows of; and another that the effect, i. e., what is called disease, "cuts no ice with the chiropractor"; and a third, that germs cause no disease.

Dr. Walton, M.D., Harvard, also D.C., in a pamphlet dated July 1, 1914, says (p. 11):

The assertion that the real and only physical cause of disease is a mechanical interference with the flow of energy from the brain to the suffering part or organ, and that this interference, in by far the majority of cases, is due to a vertebral sub-

luxation, is so different from all theories of causation heretofore advanced that at first it may seem flagrantly erroneous and wholly untenable, but the truth of this view is readily proven.

This is quoted, almost textually, with approval in the *Progressive Chiropractor*, published in Toronto in August, 1914, by the Ontario Chiropractors' Association, at page 5.

The same idea is expressed in a communication from Leo W. Edwards, M.D., D.C., dated June, 1917, in which the following passage occurs:

The basic chiropractic idea is that the human body is a machine run by force called mental impulses, generated by the brain as electricity is generated by a dynamo. From the brain these mental impulses are transmitted through the spinal cord, over the nerves to the tissue cells located in every organ and part of the material body where this energy is expressed as the function for which the particular organ is intended. The flow of mental impulses from brain to tissue cell is continual; and there is also a return circulation from tissue cell to brain, completing the cycle, whereby pain, heat and other sensations are recorded in the brain. Even the medical man realizes that each organ of the body must be properly "innervated," but he does not recognize this circulation of mental impulses which can be proven by a study of its physiological and pathological action, because, like electricity, mental impulses are an invisible force whose exact nature is not understood. The chiropractor claims that as long as the circulation of mental impulses to every part of the body is normal in quantity and rate, health will be the result, but if the supply of mental impulses is cut off or hindered, function will be stopped or hindered in like degree. That is, each organ of the body can only function according to the amount of power it receives and hence a man is in a state of health or disease according to whether the nerves are transmitting mental impulses or not.

This is probably taken from a booklet called "Chiropractic," by Dr. Robbins, Sault Ste. Marie, Mich., in which, on page 3, is the following:

Every individual has an innate (born with) and an educated intelligence. The innate intelligence is that inherent force or energy which controls and cares for the body from birth till death and is usually called nature, instinct, etc. It is this energy which controls every action and function, including the circulation, respiration, secretory, excretory, and assimilation. . . .

I have extracted these statements in order to indicate how impossible it would be to endeavor to assimilate chiropractic with our present system of medical education or practice.

A very clear illustration of the sort of instruction which may be picked up at a so-called chiropractic college is found in the evidence of one Pickles, taken at an inquest in St. Thomas, Ontario, in April, 1917, extracts from which are transmitted with this report. He was a farm hand, and took a correspondence course extending over three months, in which he wrote about twelve or thirteen letters, and received about the same number. He then went to the college in Sault Ste. Marie, carried on, in three rooms, under Dr. Robbins (from which I have quoted above), and spent two months there; heard lectures on anatomy, physiology and dietetics, and attended clinics—that is, saw treatment of patients, saw charts showing nerves, but did no dissection. This was his whole medical education, and on its conclusion, in 1912, he got a diploma as "Doctor," put out his sign, advertised and began practicing.

Dr. Palmer, in a pamphlet issued since he was heard before the Commission, says that the medical and the chiropractic courses are "as opposites as the poles."

An important statement was made by Dr. DuVal, that fake chiropractors have been produced in large numbers by bogus schools, of which I have cited an instance, and Mr. Backus, who appeared as counsel for the chiropractors, echoed this. If this be so, I am unable to reconcile it

See prev  
with the statement made to me by Dr. Palmer, that "there are about 165 chiropractors in Ontario, to the best of my knowledge. Of these 165 there is not, to the best of my knowledge, more than fifteen that I would not recommend as being competent chiropractors, and I know them all personally."

What is asked by chiropractors is that they should visit patients in hospitals and sanitarium, examine for insurance and issue death certificates.

This seems to me to be open to all the objections and difficulties I have stated as to osteopaths, and to others even more formidable having regard to the exceedingly narrow theory on which chiropractic is based. The plea that the want of "recognition" has hitherto prevented the expenditure of money in the establishment and equipment of a college or colleges does not seem to be in accord with facts as they are found in the United States.

Iowa, which does not recognize this cult, has three chiropractic schools. There are over 100 chiropractic colleges, according to Dr. Barklie, in the United States, and yet only five states have allowed the chiropractor to practice without penalty. The same difficulty appears here as in the case of the osteopaths. Education can be got in the United States without any expenditure of money other than what it costs a student. This will continue just as long as there are no requirements necessitating a proper standard of local college equipment, and no legalizing of mere practice will result in establishing here any halls of learning adequate to the science as it is viewed by its adherents, as long as those facilities exist next door on a lower plane.

The amount of real equipment possessed by Dr. DuVal is insignificant, if the items are examined, and his staff is his family circle, and yet he is without a competitor in Ontario.

Dr. Palmer, in the pamphlet to which I have alluded, makes a far-reaching remark. He says:

"Dr. Edwards told you that the secret of their legislative success lay in their publicity campaign; they educated the public mind to the acceptance of the chiropractic idea. The rest of us who are in contact with the situation realize that chiropractic education must come before chiropractic legislation."

He is definitely opposed to the Ohio legislation for recognizing and classifying the various cults which had the assent of the Ohio Chiropractic Association, and strongly supports the right of the chiropractors to practice provided they are "reputable," i. e., of a proper standard. And this fact, he says, must be determined in case of a prosecution by a jury on the testimony of other chiropractors.

Reprinted from

THE MONTHLY BULLETIN OF THE FEDERATION OF STATE MEDICAL BOARDS  
OF THE UNITED STATES, January, 1920, pp. 17-24