

national security linkages, might be country-specific case studies.⁵⁴ Such an approach would essentially attempt to take a country through the conceptual framework presented in the Paper. This would involve identifying population and "affluence" pressures, and the level and type of environmental stress being placed upon the country. It would also involve analyzing how a country's institutions address environmental stress, and how society reacts to the institutional responses. Hopefully, such case study work would eventually lead to some forecasting ability where certain types or levels of environmental stress or overall resource scarcities, in conjunction with specific institutional structures, could be identified as elements contributing to a violent outcome.

8. Epilogue

Returning to the four quotations set out in the beginning of the Paper what can be said? The first is probably an overstatement -- national security as human security extends beyond the environment; moreover the empirical evidence does not, at this time, support an inevitable, "catastrophic" conclusion. The second could be true and is consistent with the observation that scarcity may lead to conflict. The third is potentially true in the long run, but does not appear so for the near term. The fourth could be an understatement. The fourth quotation by Toynbee suggests that environmental stress in itself may make the biosphere uninhabitable. To this we must now add that environmental stress potentially contributes to a range of intrastate and interstate violence.

Given the prominence it has received, a few further words need to be said on Robert Kaplan's article for The Atlantic Monthly, "The Coming Anarchy". This cover story served to both inform and confuse. The article informs in that it has raised the issue of "human security", and a new definition of national security. It also served to raise political attention.

But "The Coming Anarchy" also confuses and seriously misrepresents linkages between environmental stress and national security. The article is centred on West Africa as a region of political-social-economic dysfunction. The article does not clearly distinguish between the interrelated causes of violence in West Africa. Scarcity of

⁵⁴The Peace and Conflict Studies Program at the University of Toronto and the American Academy of Arts and Sciences are currently undertaking a joint research project on "Environmental Scarcities, State Capacity, and Civil Violence." The project will seek to determine if scarcities of renewable resources (i.e., a more general condition than environmental stress) are decreasing the capabilities of developing countries' governments and, if so, whether this raises the probability of violent civil conflict.