

commodities to any country other than the United States. However, this permit does not cover subsequent sales or inclusion of the commodity in another product sold to a third party. There is no official Government reporting of either direct or indirect military commodity sales. Nevertheless, allegations surfaced in 1988-1989 that the Canadian Government was involved in the granting of export permits for sales of military commodities to governments involved in conflicts or known systematically to violate human rights. It was reported on 7 February 1989 that Zimbabwean Foreign Affairs Minister Nathan Shamayurira had claimed to have "hard information" concerning Canadian manufacturers violating the international arms embargo against South Africa by shipping arms to South Africa from third countries. The following day Shamayurira issued a statement denying he had made such an allegation.<sup>22</sup> Regarding indirect military sales, it was alleged in the December 1988 issue of *The Ploughshares Monitor* that \$150-200 million worth of Canadian military commodities, or products that have military application, find their way each year into the hands of governments who are at war or who are severe human rights violators.<sup>23</sup>

#### PARLIAMENTARY COMMENT

A lengthy debate took place in the House of Commons on 19 May 1989 concerning Canadian Government involvement in the ARMX-1989 exhibition. After the Associate Minister of Defence Mary Collins explained the purpose of ARMX-1989, NDP MP Dan Heap commented:

The Minister wants us to believe that they will not be dealing with weapons here. She also wants us to believe that Third World countries outside NATO will not be making purchases.... In that case, I wish she would explain why the Secretary of State for External Affairs [Mr. Clark] has said that South Africa is welcome to come, a country which we are supposedly trying to discourage from murdering its own inhabitants. Yet we want them to come out and look at weapons with which they can kill their own inhabitants or maybe the people of Namibia.<sup>24</sup>

Ms. Collins responded in part:

Less than 10 per cent of the exhibits at ARMX will focus on weapons or weapons related systems.... The remaining 90 per cent is goods and services for a whole variety of activities. Exhibits include such things as rubber life rafts and computer systems.... Let me deal finally with Third World countries. The

<sup>22</sup> Patrick Nagle, "Canadian Firm Linked to S. African Arms Sale." *Ottawa Citizen*, 7 February 1989; Patrick Nagle, "Zimbabwe Minister Says Canada Not Selling Arms to South Africa." *Ottawa Citizen*, 8 February 1989; and Mary Nemeth, *et al.*, "Canada in a Hot Seat: Joe Clark Has a Showdown in Harare." *Maclean's*, vol. 102 no. 8 (20 February 1989), p. 21.

<sup>23</sup> "Indirect Military Sales to the Third World: Hidden Road to the Arms Market." *The Ploughshares Monitor*, vol. 9 no. 4 (December 1988), pp. 13-15; and "Stricter Control Urged on Arms Components." *Ottawa Citizen*, 10 January 1989.

<sup>24</sup> *Commons Debates*, 19 May 1989, p. 1983.