

APPENDIX No. 5

Mr. J. P. DOHERTY: In saying that Quebec and Montreal are practically the same, I am speaking solely from the steamship standpoint, where the cattle are delivered alongside the steamer. If you take into consideration the reloading at the stockyards in Point St. Charles, and the switching to the railroad and discharging again, the cost is more.

Mr. STEWART: I was asking if that transfer is charged in this \$325?

Mr. DOHERTY: I think Sir Henry was speaking from the steamship angle of the situation only, and did not have in mind the operation of the railway to bring these cattle on to the docks at Montreal.

Mr. STEWART: You think his answer should be modified?

The WITNESS: It depends on what you mean by "loading." If you mean simply the operation of putting the cattle aboard from the dock, it is one thing, but if you mean getting the cattle from the stockyards on to the ship, that is another thing.

By Mr. Forrester:

Q. The charge is lower from the cattle yard to the dock?—A. I was drawing a sharp line of demarkation right at the dock. I did not mean to lead you astray.

Sir HENRY DRAYTON: You were dealing with steamships, of course.

By Mr. Stewart:

Q. With regard to this cargo which you say could be placed in the space occupied by cattle; do you mean that is a loss to the Merchant Marine, or is all that is offered carried by another boat?—A. What I mean to say is this: If the cattle were not carried on a particular vessel, that space would be used and could be used for a more remunerative traffic. Have I made that clear.

Q. That does not quite answer the question. Do you sacrifice that cargo or carry it in another vessel?—A. That I think is asking me to go rather far afield. We might lose on account of carrying cattle, let us say, a certain number of tons of more remunerative traffic. I cannot answer as to whether that would move in some other vessel, or whether it would not.

By Sir Henry Drayton:

Q. It would depend whether the owner wanted to get it across or not?—A. I suppose so.

Q. If he were altruistic enough and wanted to keep everything for the Merchant Marine, he would hold it—A. The chances are he would.

By Mr. Stewart:

Q. The point is, if it goes to some other vessel you do not lose the profit—
A. In the aggregate you are right in that, but the only way I could answer your question is by saying that we lose that much cargo.

By Hon. Mr. Graham:

Q. You have to take each ship by itself?—A. Yes, sir.

By Mr. Stork:

Q. When did the last cargo of cattle leave Quebec?—A. Last October.

Q. What is the reason the shipments have been discontinued?—A. They were discontinued during the winter time on account of navigation being closed. We have resumed now. There has been one shipment this spring.

Q. The Quebec people expected a great deal from that service. There was a large parliamentary delegation went down about a year ago to attend the loading of the first ship. They were interested because it meant traffic for our

(Sir Henry Thornton)