

harmful for a man to attempt to debate a proposition of this kind without being fully informed. In the discussion which took place the other day the hon. member for Bow River stated that to his knowledge \$500,000, which is a vast sum of money, had been spent to send two carloads of tar sands to England.

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): Where is that? I have *Hansard* right here.

Mr. DECHENE: If the hon. member will wait to make his own speech perhaps we shall get along better.

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): I am just trying to check in order to keep the hon. member to the truth.

Mr. DECHENE: I quote from page 1732 of *Hansard* of March 21:

In the course of my remarks I said that on one occasion the research department had spent \$500,000.

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): Who said that? Doctor Ells?

Mr. DECHENE: It continues:

I should like to read a little of the evidence to show what a disgraceful performance the whole thing has been. Mr. Ells appeared as a witness before the reconstruction and reestablishment committee. . . . He was asked this question . . . he does not know for sure—

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): Yes, he does.

Mr. DECHENE: He said, "I have heard of it." I am quoting from *Hansard*, and it says:

That is a vague recollection. Mind you, two carloads of Athabaska tar sands were sent clear to England—

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): Do you deny that?

Mr. DECHENE:

—at an expense of \$500,000—

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): Do you deny that?

Mr. DECHENE:

—and Mr. Ells, who was giving evidence said: "I have heard of it but I think the results have not been given out."

No such thing was ever done.

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): You are entirely wrong.

Mr. DECHENE: Two carloads of tar sands were sent to England by a private individual, General Lindsay. I know him myself. All that the Department of Mines and Resources—at that time the Department of the Interior—had to do with it was that they took the tar sands from McMurray to Edmonton.

General Lindsay paid all expenses from there to Europe. Not one dollar was spent by the government of Canada. No part of \$500,000, or any other amount of money, was spent by the government of Canada to send sand across the sea.

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): You are entirely wrong.

Mr. DECHENE: The hon. member should know it, but he does not even understand it yet. I despair of making him understand anything; only I know he put on the record and stated something that is absolutely untrue.

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): On a point of order, the hon. member has said that I made a statement which was absolutely untrue. I demand that that be retracted; because the evidence from Doctor Ells, when he spoke before the committee on reconstruction, indicates the truth of what I said, and it is recorded at page 965 of the proceedings. I shall read it, if you wish.

Mr. DECHENE: I have the floor.

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): I wish to put the statement correctly on *Hansard*.

Mr. DECHENE: I have the floor, Mr. Chairman.

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): No, not now; sit down.

The ACTING CHAIRMAN (Mr. Golding): The hon. member for Bow River may make notes, and speak later.

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): No; this is a very serious matter. The hon. member has said that I made a statement which was absolutely false. I ask him to withdraw it, because I have the record right here in my hand. The hon. member is saying something which is not correct.

The ACTING CHAIRMAN (Mr. Golding): The hon. member did not make that statement deliberately.

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): I ask for a ruling on the point of order.

Mr. DECHENE: I gave my proof. I will give the hon. member proof of what he said, and he can ask for a ruling, because—

Mr. JOHNSTON (Bow River): The hon. member said something that is not true. I am speaking to a point of order, and I am asking him to withdraw.

Mr. DECHENE: I am not withdrawing that remark, because it is true. Here is the proof in *Hansard*.