# Motions for Papers MOTIONS FOR PAPERS

#### LA HAVE, N. S. POSTMISTRESS

## Motion No. 47-Mr. McWilliam:

For a copy of all correspondence, telegrams and other documents exchanged between the Postmaster General and/or any of his officials or any other person, concerning the termination of services of the postmistress at La Have, Nova Scotia, and the appointment of a successor.

Motion agreed to.

### COMBINES INVESTIGATION ACT—BREWERY INVESTIGATION

# Motion No. 48-Mr. Eudes:

For a copy of all correspondence exchanged between Canadian Breweries Limited and Western Canada Breweries Limited or counsel on their behalf, and the Minister of Justice and the director of investigation and research under the Combines Investigation Act, or any other person in the Department of Justice, from November 6, 1957 to December 31, 1958, relating to the inquiry into the brewing industry and the prosecution thereof.

Hon. E. D. Fulton (Minister of Justice): Mr. Speaker, Canadian Breweries Limited has now been charged with an offence under the Combines Investigation Act and the case has been set down for trial. The correspondence asked for relates directly to this matter. I must therefore oppose production on the ground that it would be improper to produce such correspondence dealing with a case sub judice. I should add that once the case is disposed of I would have no objection to producing this correspondence.

**Mr. Speaker:** In view of the answer given by the minister does the hon. member consent to this motion being withdrawn subject, of course, to the right of restoring it to the order paper?

Order discharged and motion withdrawn.

# NATIONAL MUSEUM—HUMAN AND NATURAL HISTORY BRANCHES

# Motion No. 49-Mr. Argue:

For a copy of all correspondence, telegrams, reports and other documents exchanged between any cabinet minister or any of his or her deputies, the civil service commission, and any person or persons, since January 1, 1956, relating to the administration and working conditions of the human history branch and the natural history branch of the national museum of Canada.

Hon. Alvin Hamilton (Minister of Northern Affairs and National Resources): In so far as the motion refers to correspondence or other documents between ministers, or ministers and officials, or between officials and the civil service commission, or between any other categories of persons in the government service, it relates to material that is privileged in character and would not normally be returnable.

[Mr. Speaker.]

#### .

In so far as the motion refers to correspondence or other documents between ministers or persons within the public service and persons outside the public service, there is, I may say, a good deal to table. Much of it contains allegations about employees in the public service, and all these were included in the investigation to which I referred in the house on January 20. To table the documents would involve the risk of giving publicity to allegations which have, in some cases, been found to be unsubstantiated, and in others to be incapable of proof or disproof. Their publication would involve the risk of causing unjustifiable injury to personal and professional reputations. I am not prepared, Mr. Speaker, to be responsible for causing such injury.

**Mr. Speaker:** I would remind the minister that this is not a debatable motion. He may rise and say he objects or consents to the motion, but I do not think I can permit him to read a lengthy statement.

**Mr. Hamilton (Qu'Appelle):** I am simply stating that it is not in the public interest to accept this motion.

The house divided on the motion (Mr. Argue) which was negatived on the following division:

# YEAS Messrs:

#### Argue Badanai Benidickson Boivin Boulanger Bourget Cardin Caron Carter Chevrier Crestohl Denis Dumas Eudes Forgie Garland Gour Granger Habel Hellver Herridge Houck

Aiken Aitken, Miss Allard Allmark Anderson Asselin Balcer Baldwin Barrington Baskin Beech

Howard Leduc Macnaughton McIlraith McMillan McWilliam Martin (Essex East) Martin (Timmins) Meunier Michaud Nixon Peters Pickersgill Racine Regier Richard (Ottawa East) Richard (St. Maurice-Lafleche) Roberge Robichaud Tucker Winch-43.

# NAYS

### Messrs:

Bell (Carleton) Best Bigg Bissonnette Bourdages Brassard (Chicoutimi) Brooks Broome Browne (St. John's West) Browne (Vancouver-Kingsway)