

DR. DYAR'S CRITICISM OF "MOSQUITO LIFE."

BY D. W. COQUILLETT, WASHINGTON, D. C.

Dr. Dyar's criticism of "Mosquito Life" in the February number of the CANADIAN ENTOMOLOGIST (it cannot possibly be called a review—the author informs me that no copy of the book was sent to Dr. Dyar) calls for a reply, that the many false statements may be corrected. To define my own position in the case, it may be stated that when Miss E. G. Mitchell, the author, began work on the drawings for the Carnegie Monograph, she was assigned a desk in Dr. Dyar's office at the National Museum, and he was given general supervision of her work. Instead of giving her a specimen to draw, he handed her two trays containing about 35 slides of larval skins, bidding her compare them critically and ascertain if more than one species was in the lot. How well she did her work may be gleaned from the first paragraph of an article in the Journal of the N. Y. Ent. Soc., Vol. XIII., p. 107, under the title "Brief Notes on Mosquitoes," by Harrison G. Dyar, A. M., Ph. D., and which runs as follows:

"Distribution of *Theobaldia absobrinus*, Felt.—In re-examining my series of *Theobaldia incidens* from British Columbia (Proc. Ent. Soc., Wash., VI., 38, 1904), I find it to contain a mixture of a second species which I am able to identify with *T. absobrinus*, Felt."

Not one word in the entire article to indicate that the work had been done by any other person than himself! The lady continued her work for several weeks, then informed me that she would prefer to resign rather than continue working under the unpleasant existing conditions. She was therefore given desk-room in my office in the National Museum, where she continued her work on the drawings under my general supervision, and so matters stood until the cessation of her work about a year later.

I will now take up the more flagrant of Dr. Dyar's false statements in the order in which he gives them:

1. "In the title the species of the United States are said to be treated of, but in reality, only those of the Atlantic coast region are dealt with." Only a casual glance through the book is necessary to reveal the fact that *Franciscanus*, *incidens*, *varipalpus*, *Curriei*, *pullatus*, *Fletcheri*, *Spenceri*, etc., all western or Pacific Coast forms, are dealt with.

2. "The illustrations show the effects of Mr. F. Knab's expert artistic criticism." Without wishing in the least to detract from Mr. Knab's ability as a critic or artist, I am in a position to know that he never saw any of the drawings of the adults, and an incident which he himself related to