Motions for Papers

Commerce, the Minister of Mines and Technical Surveys, or any official of either of their departments, or by any one on their respective behalf, of any discussion or discussions with Mr. Frank McMahon, connected with or relative to any offer by him and his associates to build or construct a gas pipe line between the Alberta-Saskatchewan boundary and eastern Canada.

Right Hon. C. D. Howe (Minister of Trade and Commerce): Mr. Speaker, I must take exception to this motion concerning memoranda of telephone conversations. I have had a good many telephone conversations in my life, and I have never made a memorandum of any of them. This is a declaration that a minister of the crown cannot talk on the telephone or talk with anyone without tabling a memorandum of the conversation. I think that is going far beyond the purpose of motions for the production of papers. If there is a document which has been received from anyone outside of my own staff I will be only too pleased to table it, but when it comes to tabling memoranda of talks with persons or telephone conversations I must take exception.

Mr. Speaker: Does the hon. member wish me to ask for the yeas and nays?

Hon. George A. Drew (Leader of the Opposition): Mr. Speaker, before the question is put and since there is a Hansard record it might be well to point out that there is no mention here of telephone conversations.

Mr. Fulton: Have there been any?

Mr. Drew: This injection of a statement by the Minister of Trade and Commerce which seeks to create an entirely different situation than is in fact created by the question itself is something which I regret to say occurs too often. I am making this statement for the purpose of keeping the record clear that the question simply asks for any memoranda that were made. The observations made by the minister in regard to telephone conversations have no relation whatever to this question.

Mr. Speaker: Does the hon. member wish me to ask for the yeas and nays?

Mr. Diefenbaker: Yes.

Mr. Speaker: Those in favour of this motion will please say yea.

Some hon. Members: Yea.

Mr. Speaker: Those opposed to this motion will please say nay.

Some hon. Members: Nay.

Mr. Speaker: In my opinion the nays have it.

And more than five members having risen:

Mr. Speaker: Call in the members.

[Mr. Diefenbaker.]

The house divided on the motion (Mr. Diefenbaker) which was negatived on the following division:

YEAS

Messrs:

Aitken. Miss Argue Bell Blackmore Blair Brooks Bryson Cameron (Nanaimo) Campbell Cardiff Castleden Charlton Churchill Coldwell Diefenbaker Dinsdale Drew Dufresne Fleming Fraser (Peterborough) Fulton Gagnon

Green Hahn

Hamilton (Notre Dame de Grace) Harkness Hodgson

Johnson (Kindersley) Johnston (Bow River)

Jones Knight Leboe Lennard Macdonnell MacInnis MacLean McBain McGregor McLeod Michener Mitchell (London) Monteith

Montgomery Murphy (Lambton West) Nesbitt Nicholson

Pallett Pearkes Perron Poulin Quelch Rea

Robinson (Bruce) Smith (Battle River-Camrose)

Stanton Starr Thatcher Tustin White (Hastings-Frontenac)

White (Middlesex East) Winch

Wylie Zaplitny-64.

NAYS

Messrs:

Anderson Applewhaite Arsenault Ashbourne Batten Benidickson Bennett Blanchette Boisvert Bourget Bourque Brisson Brown (Brantford) Brown (Essex West)

Buchanan

Byrne Cameron (High Park) Campney Cannon Cardin Caron Carrick Carter Cauchon Cloutier Dechene Decore

Denis Deschatelets Dickey Dupuis Enfield Eudes

Follwell Fontaine

Fairey

Forgie Fraser (St. John's East) Gardiner

Garland Garson

Gauthier (Lake St. John) Gauthier (Nickel Belt) Gauthier (Portneuf)

Gingras Gingues Goode Gour (Russell) Gourd (Chapleau)

Habel Hanna Harris Harrison Healy Hellver Henderson Henry Hollingworth Hosking Houck

Howe (Port Arthur)

Huffman Hunter James Jutras Kickham

Kirk (Antigonish-Guysborough) Kirk (Shelburne-Yarmouth-Clare)

LaCroix