

to the question that was put to him. It is on that point and that alone, that we on this side contend that it is not proper that he should have counsel. The hon. gentleman smiles. I suppose, having already determined in his own mind, and having voted, that if an officer of this House is guilty of conduct that is *prima facie* wrong, this House is entitled to call him to an examination—having voted that proposition, he is now willing that we should solemnly sit as a court and listen to arguments whether this House of Commons, the highest tribunal in the land, has power to call one of its officers before it and ask him certain questions as to his proceedings. Legal gentlemen on the other side know that it is an insult to their common sense and intelligence; but if any question is put to the witness that he thinks is not in proper form or as to which he desires legal assistance, I, for one, would be only too happy to allow him to have counsel.

Sir JOHN A. MACDONALD. I rise to a question of order. The hon. gentleman says hon. members on this side know that what they say is an insult to common sense. I want to know that if that is in order.

Mr. DAVIES. I was reasoning that it would be an insult to their common sense. The hon. gentleman did not make the distinction. I say that the reason we oppose the proposition made by the man at the Bar, is one which hon. gentlemen on the other side have evaded from the first, and they are attempting to thrust on that gentleman what he has not asked, advice as to the legality of the question put to him.

Mr. MACDONALD (Huron). Would it be in order to ascertain the reason why Mr. Dunn asks for counsel? I understood him to use the words, "to protest against the proceedings of the House of Commons." What the remark will determine my vote. If he simply asks for counsel to advise him as to the questions put to him by the House, I shall willingly vote to allow him to have counsel. I think it would be in order for us to know before the vote is taken whether he wishes counsel to protest or to advise him during the investigation.

Mr. LANDRY. I think all we have to vote is the resolution before the House. I do not think any expression that was made by the gentleman at the Bar ought to influence us in our votes. If we think the resolution is right, and that it is only proper that the gentleman should have counsel, I think that is the question that challenges our votes, and not what he thinks or wants. Suppose he wants something after he gets counsel, that we think he should not have, we will refuse it; but at present we have only before us what is contained in the resolution. I admit that I heard the gentleman use words similar to what the hon. gentleman from Prince Edward Island has attributed to him; and if there is anything that convinces me that he should have counsel, it is that very fact, that he, as a layman, has already used words, not knowing the full force or significance of them, which, in my mind, prejudiced his case. He has challenged the jurisdiction of the House. It is exactly because he is here alone as a layman and has already, by the first word he has uttered, prejudiced his own case, that I am willing to vote for his having counsel. He evidently feels timid in coming here to the highest court in the land, considering his age, and all this shows the necessity of his being represented by counsel, who can look into the questions and proceedings of the House calmly. I think we have only to vote on that resolution, and when the counsel appears before us and undertakes to advise him, that will be the time for us to decide whether the course of the counsel is one we can sanction or not.

House divided on amendment of Mr. Edgar (p. 618):

YEAS:

Messieurs

Amoyt,	Edwards,	Mills (Bothwell),
Bain (Wentworth),	Ellis,	Mitchell,
Béchar, d,	Fiset,	Perry,
Borden,	Fisher,	Rinfret,
Bowman,	Gauthier,	Robertson (King's, P.E.I.),
Burdett,	Gillmor,	St. Marie,
Campbell (Kent),	Guay,	Semple,
Casey,	Hale,	Sutherland,
Charlton,	Innes,	Trow,
Cimon,	Kirk,	Turoot,
Clayes,	Landerkin,	Watson,
Davies,	Langelier (Montmor'cy),	Weldon (St. John),
De St. Georges,	Laurier,	Wilson (King),
Dessaint,	McMullen,	Yeo.—43.
Edgar,		

NAYS:

Messieurs

Armstrong,	Girouard,	Perley (Ottawa),
Audet,	Godbout,	Platt,
Baker,	Gordon,	Pope,
Bergeron,	Grandbois,	Porter,
Bergin,	Guilbault,	Purcell,
Bowell,	Guillet,	Reid,
Boyle,	Haggart,	Riopel,
Brown,	Hesson,	Robertson (Hastings),
Bryson,	Hickey,	Robillard,
Burns,	Holton,	Roome,
Cameron,	Hudspeth,	Royal,
Cargill,	Jamieson,	Rykert,
Carling,	Joncas,	Scarth,
Carpenter,	Kenny,	Scriver,
Caron, (Sir Adolphe),	Kirkpatrick,	Shakespeare,
Casgrain,	Landry,	Skinner,
Chapleau,	Langevin (Sir Hector),	Small,
Chisholm,	Macdonald (Sir John),	Smith (Ontario),
Cockburn,	Macdonald (Huron),	Somerville,
Colby,	MacDowall,	Sproule,
Coughlin,	Mackenzie,	Taylor,
Coulombe,	McCarthy,	Temple,
Coursol,	McOulla,	Thérien,
Couture,	McDonald (Victoria),	Thompson,
Daly,	McDougald (Picton),	Tisdale,
Daoust,	McDougall (U. Breton),	Tupper (Sir Charles),
Davin,	McKay,	Tupper (Picton),
Davis,	McLelan,	Tyrwhitt,
Dawson,	McMillan (Huron),	Vanasse,
Denison,	McNeill,	Waldie,
Desaulniers,	Madill,	Wallace,
Doyon,	Mallory,	Ward,
Duchesnay,	Maria,	Weldon (Albert),
Dupont,	Mills (Annapolis),	White (Cardwell),
Ferguson (Welland),	Moncreiff,	Wilmot,
Flynn,	Montague,	Wilson (Lennox),
Foster,	O'Brien,	Wood (Brockville),
Freeman,	Paterson (Brant),	Wood (Westmoreland),
Gaudet,	Patterson (Essex),	Wright.—118.
Gigault,	Perley (Assiniboia),	

Amendment negatived.

House divided on motion of Mr. Thompson (p. 616):

YEAS:

Messieurs

Amoyt,	Foster,	Paterson (Brant),
Armstrong,	Freeman,	Patterson (Essex),
Audet,	Gaudet,	Perley (Assiniboia),
Baker,	Gauthier,	Perley (Ottawa),
Béchar, d,	Gigault,	Perry,
Bergeron,	Gillmor,	Platt,
Bergin,	Girouard,	Pope,
Borden,	Godbout,	Porter,
Bourassa,	Gordon,	Purcell,
Bowell,	Grandbois,	Reid,
Bowman,	Guay,	Rinfret,
Boyle,	Guilbault,	Riopel,
Brien,	Guillet,	Robertson (Hastings),
Brown,	Hale,	Robertson (King's, P.E.I.),
Bryson,	Haggart,	Robillard,
Burdett,	Hesson,	Roome,
Burns,	Hickey,	Royal,
Cameron,	Holton,	Rykert,
Campbell (Kent),	Hudspeth,	St. Marie,
Cargill,	Innes,	Scarth,