

*The Budget—Mr. Stafford*

with other countries. He stated this was one of the highest in the world. It is not. This ratio is a middle ratio range compared to other nations. Russia and Israel have the best ratios, each having over 250 physicians per 100,000 population compared to Canada's 130 physicians per 100,000 population. Both these countries have twice as many available physicians per capita as Canada.

Furthermore, the Russians have a highly developed program for assistant doctors, what they call a "Feldshers" program, which provides a primary level of health care in factories and outlying areas. They have thousands of people engaged as Feldshers, besides having twice the density of physicians as Canada. It is unreasonable for the minister to suggest that Canada is in the same medical manpower league at all. Moreover, the Russians feel the desirable physician per population ratio to deliver ideal health care is 360 physicians per 100,000 population and is aiming for this by 1985. This will give them three times the available doctors per capita as Canada.

• (4:00 p.m.)

Both Dutch and English authorities have estimated the desirable physician ratio as being about 200 physicians per 100,000 population. If we accept this figure, which is much less than the Russian figure, Canada is still far from adequately populated with physicians, having only 130 physicians per 100,000 population. The whole of eastern Europe had a disastrously depleted medical population at the end of World War II and a very poor comparative rating with respect to Canada's medical manpower. Now, the situation is completely altered because they have had the foresight to see that their health care delivery system is geared to the number of available physicians and they have wisely anticipated and supplied the necessary manpower. Even these eastern European nations, which we have considered to be less developed than us, have surpassed us in medical manpower. I refer to Bulgaria, Hungary, Poland, Czechoslovakia, the U.S.S.R. as well as Italy and Greece. Even the similarly developed countries such as the United States, the United Kingdom, West Germany and France, have far better ratios being 186, 147, 193 and 154 respectively per 100,000 population as compared to Canada's physician-population ratio of 130 per 100,000. There are countries with worse ratios such as India with 22 physicians per 100,000 population and Indonesia with 1.4 per 100,000. In view of these 1969 statistics

from the World Medical Association, can the minister really be "one of those who have not bought this story that we are short of health personnel in this country"?

During the same television interview another important question was raised. The minister volunteered that "more doctors than we graduate each year, immigrate to Canada". The student then asked if the health manpower in Canada was not being expanded at the expense of other developing countries. The minister admitted openly that it was, and stated this was "one of the areas where we have a brain drain in our favour". I would like to examine more closely this question which the student raised of "expanding, or maintaining, our health manpower at the expense of other developing countries".

According to the Health Manpower Inventory booklet produced by the Department of National Health and Welfare in 1969, the number of Canadian graduates from our own medical schools has increased very slightly from about 850 to 1,000 per annum over the past ten years, an increase of only 150 graduates per year. At the same time, the number of immigrant physicians, which was stable in the late 50's and early 60's at about 450 per annum, has dramatically risen, especially in the past five years, to around 1,400 new immigrant medical doctors at the present time. This represents an increase per annum of 1,000 immigrant physicians over the past ten years, while our own national output has marginally increased by 150 new medical graduates. Significantly, of these 1,400 immigrant physicians, approximately half are from developing countries. These statistics, which are taken from the Department of Health and Welfare, show unequivocally that we are the beneficiaries of the brain drain as it affects the poorer nations. Moreover, information from United Nations sources indicates Canada is one of the major international bandits of trained foreign personnel.

As well as this health and welfare document I have mentioned, I have here the most recently published and comprehensive study done by the United Nations on this very problem of the "brain drain". The title of this report of the Secretary General is "Outflow of Trained Personnel from Developing Countries". In this United Nations report, Canada's very large and increasing role as a benefactor of the brain drain is made all too clear. Furthermore, I have in front of me a copy of United Nations Resolution No. 2417, which resulted from the Secretary General's report