

' That in all, 16 tenders were sent in for the performance of said work, averaging from \$182,630 to \$301,185. The four lowest tenders, being as follows :—

John S. Tolton, Walkerton.....	\$182,630
George Neilson, Belleville.....	200,375
W. H. Ellis, Toronto.....	212,155
Moore, Clendenning & Wilson, Walkerton.....	212,540

" That on the 23rd February, 1874, an Order in Council was passed, setting forth the fact that 16 tenders had been sent in, and containing as follows :—' That W. H. Ellis, whose tender is third lowest, and when extended is found to amount \$212,155, appears to be in a position to execute the work satisfactorily, and that his sureties appear to be good and solvent, and recommending that the tender of Mr. Ellis be accepted, and that for the due fulfillment of his contract satisfactory security be required on real estate, or by deposit of money, public or municipal securities, or bank stock, to the amount of 5 per cent. on the bulk sum of his contract.'

" That four days later, on the 27th February, without any information in relation to the said Ellis having, as appears by the Return, been furnished to the Department, a telegram to the following effect, was sent by Mr. Braun, Secretary of the Department of Public Works to Messrs. Moore, Clendenning & Wilson :—

" ' Your tender for Goderich Harbour Works is amongst the lowest ; are you prepared to deposit 5 per cent. of contract amount, and are both your sureties men of large means and property,' to which telegram Moore & Co., on the 28th February, replied as follows :—

" ' Prepared to make deposit and go on with Goderich Harbour Works ; can give satisfaction as to standing of sureties.'

" That on the 7th March an Order in Council was passed on a memorandum of the Minister of Public Works of the 5th March, stating :—' That Mr. Ellis has left the country, and recommending that the next lowest tender, that of Messrs. David Moore & Co., whose tender, when extended, amounts to the sum of \$212,540, be accepted.'

" That on the 20th March, 1874, a letter was addressed to J. Y. Elwood, Esq., of Goderich, instructing him to examine titles and state value of property offered by Messrs. David Moore & Co., as security, and to say what it would bring at Sheriff's sale.

" That on the 28th March, the said Elwood reported to the Department of Public Works, that the property was worth from \$5,000 to \$5,500, less a mortgage upon it of \$1,400.

" That by a schedule submitted by other valutors appointed by the Government on the 11th June, 1874, it appears that properties valued at \$11,800, less \$3,400, incumbrances, were accepted as security, the security having been fixed by the Department at \$7,500, being \$3,127 less than 5 per cent. on the bulk sum of the contract.

" That on the 16th day of February, 1877, after notice had been given of the intention to move for the papers, a letter was addressed by Mr. Page to Mr. Mackenzie, Minister of Public Works, in answer to enquiry from him, explaining the reason why the tender of John S. Tolton had not been accepted, the reason being that the tender of John S. Tolton was at that time looked upon as so low that some trouble was taken to ascertain whether he was a person acquainted with such work ; but no information could be obtained about him, and that it would be injudicious to entrust the execution of such work to him, as it probably would result, not only in a loss to the Government, but also prove ruinous to the man himself. But there does not appear to have been any correspondence in relation to the said John S. Tolton, or any reference to him or to the reason for ignoring his tender at the time the contract was let.

" That on the 22nd February, 1877, the Hon. E. Blake addressed a note to the Hon. A. Mackenzie, requesting that a letter written by him on the 2nd January, 1874, might be included among the papers, which letter was in the following terms :—

" TORONTO, January 2nd, 1874.

" ' MY DEAR MACKENZIE,—David Moore, of Walkerton, asks me to inform you that he is about to tender for the Goderich Works, and I do so accordingly. I told my friend Moore that an introduction was unnecessary, as you would let the work fairly without respect of persons.

" Yours truly,
" (Signed), ' EDWARD BLAKE.'

" That, notwithstanding the statement in the letter of Mr. Page to Mr. Mackenzie, it appears from a statement made by an honorable member in his place in this House, that the Hon. Minister of Public Works had information connected with the said John S. Tolton, the following telegram having been addressed to him by Mr. David Stirton, at that time a Member of this House :—