

Mr. Fleming (Eglinton) raised a point of order to the effect that the amendment was out of order in that its terms were not relevant to the Bill or the principle thereof and also that it, in effect, proposed the addition of another provision to the Bill.

#### RULING BY MR. SPEAKER

MR. SPEAKER: AS I see this amendment, it really is a declaration of a contrary principle to that which is under debate. The principle under debate is an amendment of the Excise Tax Act as the government has proposed. Now, the view which is brought forward is that the government has taken a wrong line and should have adopted another principle in amendment of the Excise Tax Act, that of reducing excise taxes instead of the tax with which it has dealt.

This is clearly not a matter which can be introduced as an amendment to the Bill in the course of its consideration in Committee. I think that has already been decided. At the resolution stage an attempt was made to propose an amendment in this category, and it was properly ruled out. Nor can it be introduced into the Bill when the Bill is in Committee of the Whole, because the resolution does not cover an amendment of that kind. Here, where the principle on which the government has proceeded is under consideration, it seems to me this is a proper declaration of a contrary principle. I realize that there are some difficulties in accepting this point of view. Members may raise innumerable minor amendments to the Excise Tax Act as matters of principle, and of course that could not be acceptable to the House as it would delay proceedings endlessly. But in the view I take of it—I may not be correct in this but as advised I feel I am—I think I should put the amendment to the House.

And the question being put on the said proposed amendment, it was negatived on the following division:

#### YEAS

#### MESSRS:

Argue,	Chevrier,	Macnaughton,	Regier,
Badanai,	Crestohl,	McIlraith,	Richard
Benidickson,	Denis,	McMillan,	(Ottawa East),
Boivin,	Deschatelets,	McWilliam,	Richard
Boulanger,	Dumas,	Martin (Timmins),	(Saint-Maurice-
Bourget,	Godin,	Meunier,	Lafèche),
Bourque,	Gour,	Mitchell,	Roberge,
Brassard	Granger,	Nixon,	Robichaud,
(Lapointe),	Habel,	Pearson,	Rouleau,
Cardin,	Herridge,	Pickersgill,	Tucker,
Caron,	Houck,	Racine,	Winch—43.
Carter,	Howard,	Ratelle,	

#### NAYS

#### MESSRS:

Aiken,	Beech,	Bourbonnais,	Campbell
Allard,	Bell (Carleton),	Brassard	(Lambton-Kent),
Allmark,	Bell (Saint John-	(Chicoutimi),	Campbell
Anderson,	Albert),	Browne (St. John's	(Stormont),
Asselin,	Belzile,	West),	Campeau,
Baldwin,	Best,	Browne (Vancouver-	Cardiff,
Barrington,	Bigg,	Kingsway),	Cathers,
Baskin,	Bissonnette,	Brunsdon,	Chambers,