

rations, we should have little material left. It would then fare hard with Cartier who, in his voyage of 1534, puts tropical productions in Canada, and with Popham, who (1607) made nutmegs grow in New England, and with Gosnold (1602) whose scribe makes certain men in Vineyard Sound *black and thin bearded*, and with Weymouth (1605) who makes the women of Maine *black*. Otherwise, conceding for the time the assumption that the Carli version is the original, Mr. Murphy's objection is *not criticism*. One might as well tell us that the proprietor of Merry Mount was never in New England, because he says that *they have no coughs and colds there*. Referring, however, the Ramusio and Carli versions, to an earlier version, as we have a perfect right to do, (though willing even that the matter should be decided by the Carli version *alone*, as the objections, if not corruptions, may be simply common exaggerations, like some