

HODGINS, J.A.

JANUARY 3RD, 1917.

***RE TOWN OF ALLISTON AND TOWN OF TRENTON.**

*Municipal Corporations—Bonus to Manufacturing Business—
By-law—Motion by Another Municipal Corporation to Quash
—Injurious Affection—Municipal Act, R.S.O. 1914 ch.
192, sec. 285—"Business Established elsewhere in Ontario"—
Sec. 396 (c) of Act—Ownership of Business—Identity—Com-
pany—Practical Control.*

Motion by the Corporation of the Town of Alliston to quash by-law 1157 of the Town of Trenton, passed on the 31st August, 1916, granting a bonus of \$11,000 to the Benedict Manufacturing Company of Syracuse, New York, in respect to a silver plated ware business to be carried on in Trenton.

The motion was heard in the Weekly Court at Toronto.

W. A. J. Bell, K.C., for the applicants.

I. F. Hellmuth, K.C., and A. Abbott, for the Corporation of the Town of Trenton, respondents.

HODGINS, J.A., in a written judgment, said that he allowed an affidavit to be filed on behalf of the applicants alleging, under sec. 285 of the Municipal Act, R.S.O. 1914 ch. 192, that they were injuriously affected; as the learned Judge thought they were.

A business was already in existence in Alliston, under the name of the Benedict Proctor Manufacturing Company; and it was said that, this being a business "established elsewhere in Ontario," sec. 396 (c) of the Act prohibited any bonus being granted by the Trenton corporation such as was contemplated.

Both counsel agreed that clause (c) deals with the ownership, and not the character or species of the business, and submitted the question as depending wholly on the identity or otherwise of the two concerns in point of proprietorship. The case was therefore to be disposed of on that assumption, giving "ownership" and "proprietorship" their largest meaning.

The applicants alleged that the Alliston company was a branch or subsidiary concern of or was controlled by the Syracuse company.

The business had not yet been removed to Trenton; it still existed in Alliston; and, if the professions of the respondents