

*Privilege—Mr. Luchkovich*

the estimates of the Minister of Agriculture (Mr. Motherwell) were brought down, the chairman made this statement:

The Chairman: I am sorry if hon. gentlemen did not hear the item called. It was certainly called and passed in the way we have passed other votes to-night, but I do not think it is fair to blame the chair for not announcing these items in an audible tone of voice. If hon. members would keep order in the committee, I am quite sure that I would be heard in all parts of the chamber.

I asked him whether item 44 had been called, and this is the discussion that followed:

Mr. Luchkovich: I understand that the minister said vote 44 in connection with grants to exhibitions was passed. When was it passed?

The Chairman: To-night.

Mr. Luchkovich: Well, it was passed in such a clever way that I hope that all the other estimates are not passed in the same way as this was.

Mr. Dunning: I am going to object to that on a point of order. One or two members, when the item was before the house, spoke on it. I replied to the members in a very proper way and I resent the insinuation that the vote was put through in some clever sort of way. There was no cleverness about the matter at all.

Mr. Luchkovich: There are quite a few hon. members interested in class B fairs and we have been waiting very patiently for the item to come up. I, for one, am very much surprised to learn that this item was passed.

Mr. Dunning: My hon. friend cannot blame me for his being asleep.

Mr. Luchkovich: I certainly was not asleep. I was listening and waiting very patiently for the item to come up.

The Minister of Agriculture was not in the house at the time. I am referring to vote 44. I stated that I did not hear this vote called, and the Minister of Railways said that the vote was brought up. I notice from the votes and proceedings it would appear that this item did come up; but I have read Hansard very carefully and I fail to find anything there about the item. I do notice, however, that item 46 was dealt with at the time. It is said we were asleep. If we were, Mr. Speaker, then the reporters in this house also were asleep because they did not report anything about a discussion of item 44 at that time. I can quite understand how the chairman might initial an item and pass it on to the clerk; I understand that the other day the votes and proceedings showed that an item had been passed, but the chairman admitted that it was not passed. I know that the Minister of Railways is a fair-minded man, and I am sure when he called us sleepy—

[Mr. Luchkovich.]

Mr. JOHNSTON (Long Lake): I think I should correct my hon. friend. He said the chairman agreed that the item had not been passed, but I did not agree in that way at all.

Mr. LUCHKOVICH: It is in Hansard, although I have not time to look it up.

Mr. DUNNING: I know my hon. friend does not want to be unfair to me. If he will look at page 4111 of Hansard, in the second column at the bottom, he will find that under the health of animals vote Mr. Peck and two or three other hon. members discussed class B fairs. I replied for Mr. Motherwell:

I cannot add anything to what the minister himself said with regard to the matter when he was present. But I can undertake to say that the representations of my hon. friend will be called to the attention of the minister.

That was the discussion bearing upon the very matter to which my hon. friend is referring.

Mr. LUCHKOVICH: But I still repeat that nothing is stated in Hansard to show item 44 was passed, and I take this occasion to express my indignation with the way this item was put through, if it has been passed, as I hold it has not.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am informed by the Deputy Speaker that if the hon. gentleman will confer with the clerk of the house he will show him the scroll, which shows that the item was passed.

Mr. GARDINER: That does not solve the question. If the item was never called how could it be passed? The item was never called in this house.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am informed that the item was called by the Deputy Speaker.

Mr. LUCHKOVICH: It is not in Hansard.

Mr. GARDINER: I take it that the Hansard reporters would know whether this item was called. Many members on this side of the house as well as members opposite were waiting for an opportunity to speak on that item.

Mr. SPEAKER: It is in the scroll which I hold in my hand. At any rate, I cannot allow this discussion to go on. The scroll of the house and the votes and proceedings contain the item, and I am informed that it is in the supply bill.

Mr. DUNNING: If I might supplement your remarks in that regard, Mr. Speaker, in