

*Civil Service Superannuation*

Sir HENRY DRAYTON: That might well be, but I am thinking more of the government service. If it is right to do it now, it is right to do it in ten years' time so far as the government service is concerned. The provision for extension should either be struck out entirely or left for all time in the discretion of the government. Surely if the government have a man ten years from now who, though seventy years of age, is rendering valuable service, they would be right in retaining him. I am confident that the minister knows I am right.

Mr. MALCOLM: The objection taken by the civil servants themselves was that if there is not compulsory retirement, promotion is blocked. The committee were not particularly strong on the clause, whether it should be left to cover those now in the service or whether it should apply to all. Personally I have no objection to the power being granted, though there is always danger that the power may be abused.

Sir HENRY DRAYTON: What is the basis of my hon. friend's idea? Should the government have the right to retain an efficient servant or not? Should the country be put to a double cost, the cost of the annuity plus the remuneration to the new appointee, to say nothing of teaching a new hand to do the work? That is what it comes down to.

Mr. MALCOLM: The new entrant usually comes in from the bottom at a smaller salary. It is questionable whether it would cost the government more to replace a junior and move the others up.

Sir HENRY DRAYTON: As a general rule, when they get to that age they have reached their maximum, and their retirement will be based on that maximum. To follow the bill as drafted would certainly be to duplicate expense in many cases.

Mr. MALCOLM: I doubt that.

Sir HENRY DRAYTON: Then why have this thing in at all? If the whole consideration is that there is a blocking of advancement, then everybody should be taken off at seventy, whether good or ill.

Mr. MALCOLM: There is a question of justice in regard to those in the service today who have been contributing to the superannuation fund or who are about the retiring age. If they are allowed to remain a little longer they may be able to enlarge their contribution and make their superannuation worth while.

[Mr. Malcolm.]

Sir HENRY DRAYTON: I am not going to delay the bill, but this provision to do away with any extension after ten years does seem to me absurd.

Mr. ROBB: I do not want to offer any substantial amendment to the unanimous report of the committee, who have given so much time and study to this question, but I am bound to say that I agree with the ex-Minister of Finance. I know there are men in the service who have passed seventy years of age whom the government would not want to lose.

Mr. FORKE: Strike it out.

Sir HENRY DRAYTON: It is only necessary to strike out the words following "not exceeding five years" on line 7.

Mr. ROBB: If it is the unanimous wish of the committee, I move that section 10 be amended by striking out of subsection 2 the following words, commencing on line 7:

But no such extension shall be granted after the expiration of ten years from the date of the coming into force of this act.

Amendment agreed to.

Section as amended agreed to.

On section 11—Regulations by Governor in Council.

Sir HENRY DRAYTON: What is to be covered by (d)?

Mr. ROBB: The committee thought there might be cases difficult to decide, and that it would be well to give the Governor in Council power to prescribe by regulations.

Sir HENRY DRAYTON: I understood we were to have a general superannuation act applying to all classes of employees, even the permanent temporaries. Now apparently we have a provision which indicates that it will be only a partial superannuation.

Mr. MALCOLM: The intention of the committee was to make the act as broad in its scope as possible. There might be doubt in some cases in determining just the application of the act. In the vernacular this is really an omnibus clause to give the minister power to deal with those cases.

Sir HENRY DRAYTON: The idea is not to exclude any of them?

Mr. MALCOLM: The idea is rather to bring others in under the act.

Sir HENRY DRAYTON: I should think that the Governor in Council would not want to change the basis for the computation of