

The burden of his criticism was based on these mis-quotations and mis-statements of the facts. In some of these cases the temperature varied somewhat, but in most of them the temperature was within a few degrees of what the products carried in the chamber required.

In his speech, he stated over and over again that the butter was put into these chambers at such and such a temperature. There is no record of the temperature of the butter when it was put into the chamber; the record is only the record of the temperature of the chamber itself; and in ninety-nine cases out of one hundred that temperature, at the time the butter is loaded into it when the chamber is open to the air, is much higher than the butter put into it coming from cold storage warehouses. But when the chamber is filled and closed, the mechanical cold storage brings the temperature down at once, and in almost all cases the record shows that where butter was stored the temperature was an even 30 to 34 degrees for the whole voyage until opened to the warmer air on landing in England.

Were Mr. Smith familiar with the handling of butter, he would know that, while it is well that butter intended to be kept for months should be in a chamber as low as 20 degrees—that for carriage to England, to be put before the consumer in a few days after arrival in England, 30 to 35 is quite cold enough for the proper and safe carriage of our butter.

To take up some details of Mr. Smith's criticism, as specimen of his inaccuracy and mis-statement: On pages 8,168, 6,970-1 of "Hansard" of last session are, amongst others, these statements:

"On the 'Monteagle,' which sailed May 29th, 1903, butter went in at a temperature of 40 degrees and never reached a point lower than 34 degrees."

Quite true; on the face of the record was the statement that cheese was carried in the same compartment, and that the engineer was instructed to keep this chamber at a temperature higher than 35 degrees.

Again, after quoting several records which were quite good, Mr. Smith says:

"On the 'Hibernian,' butter went in at a temperature nearly 70 degrees, but the refrigerator chambers were never able to get down the temperature lower than 42 degrees," etc., and winds up by, "I would not be surprised if all the butter in that steamer was entirely lost."

Perhaps Mr. Smith will be more surprised when he is reminded that on the face of this record—what he must have seen—it was apples and not butter in that chamber.

Again, Mr. Smith: "On the 'Iona,' the 5th of September from Montreal, the butter went in at a temperature of 66 degrees but never got to a point at any