

ON AGROTIS TRITICI, LINN., AB. SUBGOTHICA HAW., AND  
AGROTIS JACULIFERA, GN.

BY J. W. TUTT, F. E. S., LONDON, ENGLAND.

I have read with interest the paper by Mr. Slingerland, CAN. ENT., XXVII., p.p. 301-308, and as my name is occasionally mentioned, I trust to the courtesy of our Editor to allow me to reply.

In the first place, I would premise by suggesting that Mr. Grote had more than the bare statement of mine quoted by Mr. Slingerland on p. 302, and was not guided by that alone. He had, I presume, at least seen my notes in the *Entomologists' Record*, and in *British Noctue and Their Varieties*, Vol. II. These Mr. Slingerland appears to have overlooked.

I would point out to American readers that Haworth called his book *Lepidoptera Britannica*, that he described no species knowingly that were not British, and that the onus of proving that he did so rests on Mr. Slingerland, and those who think with him. I would point out also that although Mr. Grote and Prof. Smith may not "have ever seen the original description of *subgothica*," yet I can assure Mr. Slingerland that I had, and that as Mr. Grote, according to his letter, based "his recent revision on the authority of Mr. Tutt," it matters little whether Mr. Grote saw it or not, for he shifts the onus upon my shoulders.

With regard to the species in dispute, I would refer your readers to the quotation referring to the species Haworth described (*vide*, ante. p. 302), in which Haworth says of the species "Habitat in Anglia valde infrequens."\* Now, Mr. Slingerland has to face this point. The American species does not occur in England; the species Haworth describes does occur in England; therefore the species that Haworth describes cannot possibly be the American species, by any laws of logic I know.

As Mr. Slingerland says, "No figure of the insect is given"; therefore the whole value of Haworth's name rests on his description. The first question, it seems to me, is not, "Is there anything in it that does not apply to our American insect?" for thus far we have not come to the possibility of its being American, but rather, "Is there any British insect to which it applies absolutely?" and I say, yes! most decidedly, yes! and the insect to which it applies is one of the endless forms of *Agrotis tritici*.

---

\*This was written in 1810, and Mr. Slingerland does not suggest the possible introduction of American specimens into England until 20 years later.—J. W. T.