

RULING BY MR. ACTING SPEAKER

THE ACTING SPEAKER (Mr. Penner): The Chair has given consideration to the subamendment moved in the name of the honourable Member for Oshawa-Whitby (Mr. Broadbent). As I indicated earlier to the Minister of Finance (Mr. Turner) and other honourable Members, there was a difficulty which the Chair thought could be in the amendment but there has now been an opportunity to consider its procedural acceptability more carefully.

It is quite clear that very good arguments can be made on both sides as to whether there is in fact a different proposition being proposed in the amendment, that is, an alternative proposal. That argument can be established on the one hand. On the other hand, the view might be put forward that the subamendment meets the rule of relevancy.

Having considered both sides of the question and taking into account—and it is rather important to the Chair—that there is a reasoned amendment now before the House, the Chair would accept the subamendment as moved.

Debate was resumed on the motion of Mr. Turner (Ottawa-Carleton), seconded by Mr. Sharp,—That Bill C-49, An Act to amend the statute law relating to income tax, be now read a second time and referred to a Committee of the Whole.

And on the motion of Mr. Lawrence, seconded by Mr. Baker (Grenville-Carleton), in amendment thereto,—That all the words after “That” be struck out and the following substituted therefor:

“this House declines to give second reading to Bill C-49, An Act to amend the statute law relating to income tax, because it fails to provide for a further 5% reduction in personal income tax in the 1975 and subsequent taxation years despite unprecedented government revenues and the resulting overtaxation by the Government.”

And on the motion of Mr. Broadbent, seconded by Mr. Knowles (Winnipeg North Centre), in amendment to the amendment,—That the amendment be amended by deleting therefrom the words “a further 5% reduction” and by substituting therefor the words “a \$400 tax credit”.

And debate arising thereon;

[At 5.00 o'clock p.m., Private Members' Business was called pursuant to Standing Order 15(4)]

(Public Bills)

The Order being read for the second reading and reference to the Standing Committee on Justice and Legal Affairs of Bill C-220, An Act to amend the Criminal Records Act;

Mr. Rynard, seconded by Mr. Baker (Grenville-Carleton), moved,—That the Bill be now read a second time and referred to the Standing Committee on Justice and Legal Affairs.

And debate arising thereon;

The hour for Private Members' Business expired.

Debate was resumed on the motion of Mr. Turner (Ottawa-Carleton), seconded by Mr. Sharp,—That Bill C-49, An Act to amend the statute law relating to income tax, be now read a second time and referred to a Committee of the Whole.

And on the motion of Mr. Lawrence, seconded by Mr. Baker (Grenville-Carleton), in amendment thereto,—That all the words after “That” be struck out and the following substituted therefor:

“this House declines to give second reading to Bill C-49, An Act to amend the statute law relating to income tax, because it fails to provide for a further 5% reduction in personal income tax in the 1975 and subsequent taxation years despite unprecedented government revenues and the resulting overtaxation by the Government.”

And on the motion of Mr. Broadbent, seconded by Mr. Knowles (Winnipeg North Centre), in amendment to the amendment,—That the amendment be amended by deleting therefrom the words “a further 5% reduction” and by substituting therefor the words “a \$400 tax credit”.

After further debate, the question being put on the amendment to the amendment, it was negatived on the following division:

(Division No. 14)

YEAS
Messrs.

Allard	Firth	Leggatt
Beaudoin	Fortin	Matte
Benjamin	Gilbert	Nystrom
Broadbent	Knowles	Orlikow
Caouette	(Winnipeg	Peters
(Villeneuve)	North Centre)	Rodriguez
Dionne	Lambert	Symes—18.
(Kamouraska)	(Bellechasse)	

NAYS
Messrs.

Abbott	Balfour	Campbell (Miss)
Alexander	Basford	(South Western Nova)
Alkenbrack	Bawden	Caron
Allmand	Beatty	Carter
Anderson	Béchar	Chrétien
Andras	Bégin (Miss)	Clarke
(Port Arthur)	Blais	(Vancouver Quadra)
Andre	Blaker	Clermont
(Calgary Centre)	Boulanger	Coates
Andres	Brisco	Comtois
(Lincoln)	Bussières	Condon
Appolloni (Mrs.)	Caccia	Corbin
Baker	Cadieu	Corriveau
(Gander-Twillingate)	Cafik	Côté
Baker	Campagnolo (Mrs.)	Crouse
(Grenville-Carleton)		Cullen