

Q. Why?—A. Because he may not be any good in the management of men. He may have the knowledge to pass the examination and not be worth five cents after you get him.

Q. You have to take into consideration other qualifications than the mere writing of an examination paper?—A. Yes.

*By Mr. Gauthier:*

Q. In your department, since the introduction of the 1908 Bill appointing the Civil Service Commission, have any nominations been made without being recommended for promotion by your officials?—A. Only in one or two instances.

Q. Only in one or two instances?—A. Yes.

Q. Were there competitive examinations at that time?—A. Were there what?

Q. Were there competitive examinations when one or two were named?—A. Yes, but as a rule we have agreed with the Commission without any trouble.

Q. But, as a rule, the promotions in your department have been made according to your suggestions to the Commission?—A. Yes.

*By Mr. Currie:*

Q. What difference does it make to you, as far as the Commission is concerned? You would have carried out under the old system?—A. You have less friction in the department, and that means a great deal to the department, because we are busy, and not to have any friction is a great big consideration.

Q. In other words, you quietly send the recommendation on for the promotion without regard for anybody, letting the clerks understand it is purely a matter for the Commission to settle, so they will not raise any racket?—A. No, not at all. We have a report from his postmaster, and his superior officer.

Q. You simply slip it over to the Commission to place that man?—A. They do not always do it.

Q. How often do they do it?—A. Perhaps two or three times.

Q. How many promotions have you made?—A. A good many.

Q. You have made hundreds of changes?—A. Yes, we have made a great many. In my opinion, there is not any other way.

Q. Supposing you have, as is described here—we have got the chart of the clerks, and the Junior Clerks, instead of there being one Junior Clerk here wanting to get into this higher grade, there are several, each one wanting to get in, and each one having the same university qualification. How does that come about?—A. Through the superior officer. We rely on the judgment of the superior officer.

Q. But where does the Civil Service Commission come in to protect this young fellow? Supposing one fellow has a better certificate than the other?—A. They can appeal to the Commission.

Q. Without appealing, they have not got a chance in the world?—A. No, I do not think they should have.

Q. In England it is absolutely that the man who gets the highest marks gets the position?—A. He may not be worth as much.

Q. But that is the law, and that was the law we were anxious to pass here. Is that not the law, Mr. Calder?

HON. MR. CALDER: I am not sure. Let me ask Dr. Roche. Doctor, under the law as it stands, is the Commission supposed to make all these promotions on a competitive basis, or have you authority under the law to make promotions without holding examinations, simply on the recommendation of the officials of the department who are cognizant of the facts?

DR. ROCHE: There must be some kind of a competitive test, either a written examination on the duties of the office, or the ratings of qualification based on efficiency, seniority and fitness for the office, where there is more than one applicant eligible.

[Dr. R. M. Coulter.]