

4
and tells us that we must draw a black line over all that has been written on the subject in our histories. But not so fast.

Of course, it is the right, nay the duty of every historical student to criticise the annals of the past and eliminate the false from the true. There is too little of this work done in these days. But the critic himself is amenable to criticism, and Mr. Murphy's work is open to serious objections. He, indeed, makes out a plausible theory, and his ingenious arguments might deceive even the elect. Still, while the spirit of the writer is admirable, and the aim fair, his work is quite overshadowed by the influence of the professional habit; and we discover, not only the historian in search of truth, but the attorney warmly reaching out to grasp the verdict. Hence the work is characterized by organic weakness, disguised under an appearance of strength.