

"the only ones employed in the service." What Messrs. McLelan and Campbell did say was, "Previous to the Union paddle-wheel steamers only were employed, and it was very generally believed, and for good reasons, that a screw steamer would maintain steam communication to a much later period; but it is altogether improbable that any man who had seen the Straits of Northumberland, or had any knowledge of the ice obstruction in mid-winter, could have supposed it possible to construct a steamer capable of crossing when the ice is at its heaviest in that season, and it is proper to assume that both contracting parties to the Union having such knowledge understood that the Dominion Government would provide and maintain the means which science and experience might determine as the best and most efficient for the end in view, within the range of possibility." This full extract places a different light upon the matter, and it has been amply demonstrated above that the Dominion Government has done its best to provide continuous steam service "within the range of possibility," and that its efforts have been beneficial to the island.

Objection is also taken to the remark of the Committee of Council, "that the change from sailing vessels to steamers for summer appears to have been the only improvement effected by the Island Government in their means of communication in 50 years, although having control of a larger sum in revenue than the island now pays into the Dominion." The first part is not denied by Messrs. Sullivan and Ferguson, but the revenue question is again disputed. They go on to say that the prospect of continuous steam service was one of the principal inducements that led the island to enter the Dominion. Messrs. McLelan and Campbell's report gives the impression that they desired to convey the idea that, although the Island Government had not done much before Confederation to provide continuous steam service in winter, the Dominion Government had since that time much improved the communication; and this cannot be denied.

The next point of difference is the number of passengers using the route. Messrs. McLelan and Campbell say that during the past two winter seasons the average number of passengers in each crossing of the "Northern Light" was only nine (the average of the present season so far is said to have been only six); also that the loss on the Island Railway since its opening has been \$843,911, besides an expenditure thereon on capital account of about \$500,000. Messrs. Sullivan and Ferguson in reply give instances of 100 passengers crossing at one time. This only proves how small the number must have been on other occasions, if the average of each crossing is only nine. Then they say that the number of passengers would be greater if the service were more regular, *and the seaworthiness of the ship more assured.* This latter is a grave charge against the Dominion Government, and cannot be allowed to pass without protest, especially as the statement is but a general one and unsubstantiated.

Exception is also made to the remark of the Committee of Council, "that the Dominion Government did not undertake the carrying of agricultural produce or freight of any kind, although they have at all times afforded facility for the transport of any offering." Messrs. Sullivan and Ferguson say, "The facility afforded may be judged of when it is explained that the freight capacity of the 'Northern Light' is not more than 200 barrels." It must be remembered that the phrase "continuous steam service" applied to passengers and mails only, and *any* provision for freight is therefore a gain to the province.

Messrs. McLelan and Campbell say, "It will be claimed on behalf of the island that the population consumes goods the produce of the mainland. No doubt this is true, but the same occurred previous to the confederation." The figures for 1872 are given as \$1,067,480. The Prince Edward Island delegates state that of this \$371,163 came from countries other than Canada, although through Dominion ports, reducing the imports from Canada to \$638,127. The accuracy of these figures (there is no means of checking them in the office of the High Commissioner), does not affect the general question.

The Dominion Government gave the total value of the goods entered for consumption in the island in 1872 as \$1,605,241. This Messrs. Sullivan and Ferguson object to, and state that the figures should be \$2,439,078. There are no means of checking this in the office of the High Commissioner.

Messrs. McLean and Campbell say that "No doubt the same inter-provincial trade continues with this change in favour of Prince Edward Island—that the goods from the other provinces are now free of duty, whilst previous to the Union they paid duties the same as on importations from other countries." Messrs. Sullivan and Ferguson do not object to this, and express their concurrence in the present fiscal