

CO-OPERATIVE LIFE INSURANCE.

THE FALLACY OF THE ASSESSMENT PLAN, AS A SUBSTITUTE FOR LIFE INSURANCE, ILLUSTRATED FROM THE RECORDS OF THE BEST SOCIETIES.

Five years since, nine of the most permanent-looking of the assessment associations of Pennsylvania were selected and their history given, as to membership and death losses, during each year from their beginning. As successive years have rolled round, the experience of an additional twelve-month has been added, and the figures given. Two years ago, three of the original nine companies were unable to hold the confidence of their members, and came to a dead halt. The other six still live, and had a membership in 1877, 1880 and 1883 as follows:

Names of Associations.	Membership in		
	1877.	1880.	1883.
Mutual of Pottsville.....	83	95	89
Odd Fellows, Montrose	1,393	900	282
Lake Shore Masonic.....	1,260	1,259	1,103
Temperance Mutual.....	2,850	1,445	931
Home Mutual, Lebanon.....	1,002	3,064	1,336
United Brethren, ".....	14,237	12,064	9,662
Totals.....	20,315	19,427	13,433

A very rapid decline will be noticed during the last period of three years, compared with the first. New members are not now so easily found, and many old ones seem to think they have paid long enough, now that assessments are levied five and six times as fast as they were at first.

There were, at one time, in the State of Pennsylvania no less than 236 of these assessment societies. Now there are only 24, and all of these have a very sickly look, as if their days were numbered. The list we give above, being six of our original nine, constitutes one-quarter of the whole number above ground in that important State—the birth-place of the assessment plan.

Below will be found the record, year by year, for ten years past, of the three largest Pennsylvania societies, of the Southern Tier of New York State, and of the London Masonic; of the Province of Ontario:

TEMPERANCE MUTUAL BENEFIT.

Year.	New Mem- bers.	Total Members.	No. of Deaths.	Costing per \$1,000.
1874.....	563	935	4	\$4 27
1875.....	507	1,389	8	5 17
1876.....	551	1,549	14	9 03
1877.....	1,094	2,305	25	10 80
1878.....	415	1,757	23	13 08
1879.....	597	1,939	11	5 67
1880.....	483	1,445	33	22 83
1881.....	332	1,329	23	17 30
1882.....	49	957	20	20 90
1883.....	146	931	16	20 40

ODD FELLOWS MUTUAL.

Year.	New Mem- bers.	Total Members.	No. of Deaths.	Costing per \$1,000.
1874.....	207	1,888	11	\$6 51
1875.....	241	1,802	17	9 21
1876.....	153	1,676	21	12 53
1877.....	87	1,393	19	13 64
1878.....	100	1,248	19	15 27
1879.....	220	1,097	20	18 23
1880.....	6	846	23	27 18
1881.....	3	539	10	18 55
1882.....	3	419	8	19 09
1883.....	0	282	13	46 09

UNITED BRETHREN MUTUAL AID.

Year.	New Mem- bers.	Total Members.	No. of Deaths.	Costing per \$1,000.
1874.....	1,713	7,033	8	\$8 24
1875.....	3,721	9,900	110	11 11
1876.....	3,378	12,102	135	11 15
1877.....	4,035	14,237	243	17 00
1878.....	4,633	13,826	256	18 51
1879.....	2,019	12,409	252	20 30
1880.....	1,967	12,684	308	24 28
1881.....	1,465	12,059	296	24 54
1882.....	1,093	10,947	335	30 60
1883.....	767	9,662	272	28 15

SOUTHERN TIER MASONIC RELIEF ASSOCIATION.

Year.	Average Members.	No. of Deaths.	Costing per \$1,000.	Av. in Periods.
1869-70.....	742	5	\$6 50	\$5 50
1871-74.....	2,180	24	10 75	11 00
1875.....	3,311	37	11 25	
1876.....	3,728	58	15 50	13 90
1877.....	4,052	58	14 30	
1878.....	4,273	51	11 90	15 57
1879.....	4,403	73	16 60	
1880.....	4,295	60	13 90	17 85
1881.....	4,065	66	16 20	
1882.....	9,787	73	19 00	17 85
1883.....	3,458	68	16 70	

LONDON MASONIC MUTUAL BENEFIT.

Year.	Average Members.	No. of Deaths.	Costing per \$1,000.	By Periods.
1872-73.....	1,740	14	\$8 04	\$8 04
1874.....	1,960	16	8 10	10 30
1875.....	2,250	25	11 50	
1876.....	1,944	25	12 80	10 83
1877.....	1,697	21	12 30	
1878.....	1,603	20	12 40	15 30
1879.....	1,555	12	7 80	
1880.....	1,475	27	18 31	17 40
1881.....	1,446	20	13 80	
1882.....	1,447	20	13 80	17 40
1883.....	1,492	26	17 40	

These figures should be carefully examined in order to note the rapid increase of members, so long as the death losses called for less than \$10 or \$12 on each certificate of \$1,000, and then the decline of membership as the cost went up to \$15, or \$20 or \$30.

The Temperance Mutual closed the year 1883 with no less than thirteen widows' claims unpaid. It collected, during the year, \$13,336, of which only \$8,982 could be paid to sixteen claimants—about \$500 to each. The expenses consumed the other \$4,354. A vigorous and expensive effort seems to have been made to get in new blood, without much result. It is scarcely likely to outlive the present year.

The Odd Fellows Mutual will scarcely make another appearance in public, its large membership of 1,802, in 1875, having now dwindled away to 282, in consequence of increasing death losses rendering it impossible to draw in new members. It is the same old story over again. The total receipts were \$3,611, of which the widows got only \$3,159—\$269 each.

Our Masonic readers will be interested in the "Southern Tier" and the "London Masonic" statistics. The ties of brotherhood seem to have been more effectual in their case than in others, in preventing, as yet, a stampede of healthy members but their death losses, nevertheless, continue to grow heavier, and the disaster will be all the more terrible when it does come.

It should not be overlooked that, in the column "cost per \$1,000," in the above tables, expenses are not included. In some cases, such as the Temperance Mutual, the expenses would add one-half to the figures for 1883, giving