

Q. You cannot remember anything about it?

Mr. CARVELL.—I object to my friend going into any private transactions between this gentleman and his solicitor.

The CHAIRMAN.—Supposing that this solicitor got half the price of this contract, would it be improper to ask it?

Mr. CARVELL.—No, because then he does not get it for solicitor's fees.

Mr. FOWLER.—How do you know; that might be the arrangement.

The CHAIRMAN.—The witness is not objecting himself.

Mr. CARVELL.—I am going to object to this witness being asked to produce here the private bills of his solicitor.

The CHAIRMAN.—The only person who could object to that would be the solicitor and his client, and as neither has objected I do not see why you should.

Mr. PRINGLE.—I, as his solicitor, object to going into any private business between Mr. Grant and Mr. Playfair.

The CHAIRMAN.—Would his business be considered private supposing a payment was made to this solicitor in consideration that he got the contract from the government?

Mr. PRINGLE.—The relationship between solicitor and client is pretty well privileged.

The CHAIRMAN.—Mr. Playfair says he has no objection, and I suppose you have no objection to prevent it.

The WITNESS.—If I got a chance now I would not take the contract for \$5,500.

By the Chairman:

Q. You said something about having to keep your boats in commission because of insurance; what do you mean by that?—A. Our last boat leaves Fort William at midnight on 12th December and they come down to Collingwood and all the other Georgian Bay ports, and supposing one of them was to get into trouble we would have to get some one to relieve her, we would get one say from the Great Lakes Towing Company. I went out in 1903 with the *Canada Atlantic* at \$1,000 a day.

Q. So that in the interests of the safety of your own boats you have to keep the Midland harbour open?—A. Oh, no, I have not. I could put these big tugs in Collingwood harbour if I wanted to.

Q. Midland is your headquarters?—A. Yes.

Q. As a matter of fact, in your own interest, to preserve your insurance on your boats, you have as a practice been keeping Midland harbour open?—A. Oh, no, not without being paid for it. One year a boat came in, the *Matthews*, and could not get in, and it had to go to your town to be unloaded. Midland does not want to get a bad name for boats not getting in. If you do not come to me to break the ice you have to give it to somebody else.

Q. There was one year in which you kept the harbour open of your own volition without any instruction from the government?—A. I do not think so.

The CHAIRMAN.—Well the correspondence shows.

Mr. PRINGLE.—That is only 1905 that refers to.

Mr. BENNETT (Simcoe).—That boat has been coming for twenty-five years when there was no ice-breaking.

By Mr. Fowler:

Q. Is that not a fact?—A. I was not there that year.

Q. You have been there?—A. Boats did not leave Fort William and Port Arthur then as late as they do now.

Mr. BENNETT (Simcoe).—I have seen them come in on the 15th December.