party is in power, but if this position is being left vacant because there is no Conservative doctor near the reserve, then in the interests of the Indians a Liberal doctor should be appointed. My understanding is that this vacancy has existed for some months, in fact ever since a certain gentleman was appointed to the Senate. Previous to that time Senator Macdonald was the medical man in charge of this reserve, and in my opinion he was the proper man to have the job under a Conservative government, he being a good Conservative. The only other doctor there was the man who held the position before 1930, and who, no doubt quite properly, was discharged after this government came into power. It seems to me, if there is no Conservative doctor near, in the interests of the Indians, this other man should be reappointed immediately. I should like the minister to tell me exactly what the position is in regard to the matter.

Mr. MURPHY: I anticipated that when I asked the hon. member to defer his question, I would have all the information that he desires. If he will kindly wait a little longer until I get another official here, I shall be able to give him fuller information. I have a certain general knowledge of the matter, but I desire to answer his question as accurately as possible, and I shall obtain the services of the other official as soon as I can.

Mr. DUFF: It is not necessary to do that. I am quite satisfied with the minister's explanation as far as it went, and I want him also to take what I say. I said it in good faith and I think I was fair enough to say that if there was a Conservative doctor there, he should be appointed immediately. I understand there is not a Conservative doctor within a good many miles: therefore the only doctor there being a Liberal, he should be appointed without delay. The cost will not be very much, and rather than have the Indians suffer from want of medical attention, I think my hon. friend will agree with me, if my statement is correct, that doctor should be appointed immediately.

Mr. MURPHY: I am informed that the services are being performed at the present time by a doctor who is being paid on accounts, so the Indians are not suffering from lack of medical attention.

Mr. DUFF: What doctor is that and where does he live?

Mr. MURPHY: Doctor Digout.

Mr. DUFF: That is the man I should like to have appointed; he is a Grit.

Supply-Indian Affairs

Mr. RALSTON: There is another case of an Indian doctor in Shelburne county. Doctor L. P. Churchill was the Indian doctor there for a number of years and he was replaced comparatively recently by the appointment of Doctor C. A. Herbin. I asked the minister, early in the session, on whose recommendation the change was made. When the answer came down it was, according to page 389 of Hansard, "on instructions issued by the superintendent general." As reported on page 434 of Hansard, I pointed out that this was not an answer to the question, and I do not think I have had any answer since. I want to ask my hon. friend on whose recommendation the change was made.

Mr. MURPHY: The question as put by the hon. member, I think he will agree, was one based upon an assumption. It was not a direct question.

Mr. RALSTON: Well, I am asking the minister the question: was it made on a recommendation?

Mr. MURPHY: If my memory serves me correctly, yes.

Mr. RALSTON: On whose recommendation?

Mr. MURPHY: I am sorry that at the present moment I cannot recall, but I am quite willing to answer the question; I have no objection to doing so.

Mr. RALSTON: I am sure of that. I only want to point out that it has not been answered. The question was, on whose recommendation the appointment was made, and the answer, "on instructions issued by the superintendent general," is not very informative nor, I think, is it a proper answer. I should like to indicate to the minister the situation with regard to this appointment. Doctor Churchill is an ex-service man, with, I think, three years' service overseas and the military cross. He was born in the county of Shelburne; he has lived there all his life. The gentleman who has replaced him, Doctor Herbin, has lived in the county some five years and has no overseas service. I want to ask the minister the reason for the dismissal of Doctor Churchill and the appointment of Doctor Herbin.

Mr. MURPHY: This position occupied formerly by Doctor Churchill and later by Doctor Herbin is not one which carries a salary. The accounts are paid on what is know as the "call system;" that is, the agent calls in any doctor to provide the medical services for the Indians in question. It is not a regular salaried position.