

It is the considered judgment of the Canadian National Railways that the best interests of the railway and of the public will be served by a co-ordination of the terminals of the company at Montreal in the manner decided upon. No engineering project has been more fully examined than that for the creation of a Central Station on the Dorchester Street site.

The substitute plans for taking the lines of the Canadian National into Windsor Street station were also closely studied by independent engineering authority and found to be incompatible with securing the efficiency and economy sought for, and providing for the growth and development of the city.

Of all the plans which have been put forward at various times to solve the grade separation and railway transportation problem of the city of Montreal, the Canadian National plan was the one which was selected by that eminent engineer Sir Frederick Palmer, M.Inst.C.E., M.Am.Soc.C.E., as being the best adapted to the requirements of the city.

It will be recalled that when there was submitted to the Government an alternative plan based on the use of Windsor Street station the Hon. C. A. Dunning, then Minister of Railways and Canals, decided to obtain the best available independent engineering advice, and Sir Frederick Palmer, who had wide experience in the development of ports and terminals in various countries, was selected. After examining in all twenty proposals, he reported to the Federal Government that the Canadian National terminal plan was the one best adapted to the requirements of the city. Sir Frederick stated:

"It is believed that every one of these proposals has been carefully considered (certainly all the known proposals have been examined), and it is no disparagement to even the best of these schemes to say that the C.N.R. plan, which has resulted from prolonged study of the question in all its aspects by the extremely competent officials of that railway, is incomparably the best."

In the concluding remarks of his report, dealing with two last-minute alternatives, Sir Frederick said:

"The purpose for which these two belated proposals are submitted is not understood. There is nothing to recommend one or the other, and it is obvious that they are 'compromise' suggestions, in which the true needs of Montreal are sacrificed to vested interests. The only lesson to be learned from them is that if they represent the best that can be devised as alternatives thereto, the Tunnel proposal stands without a real competitor."

Before reaching a decision to recommence the work on the terminal, on a modified plan, the whole situation was again reviewed by the Canadian National, and the conclusion was reached that judged from the requirements of the railway for improved and co-ordinated terminal facilities as well as the relationship of terminals to the development of the community, the Central Station plan should be held to.

In considering the possibility of using Windsor Street station it became evident that only a portion of the trains could be routed into that station without a serious increase in mileage and slowing down of schedules. The problem of trains from the west presented

little difficulty, but the routes of all trains from the east using Bonaventure Station would have to be increased by twenty-one miles and passengers on these trains, after coming within sight of Montreal at St. Lambert, would have to be taken twenty-six miles by a circuitous route to cross the St. Lawrence River at Caughnawaga. It is also impracticable to make use of Windsor Street station for the Canadian National trains which presently use Tunnel terminal and McGill Street. Joint studies in 1933 developed that the use of Windsor Street station, even to a limited extent, would involve an expenditure of \$6,000,000 for the station and coach yard and the almost certain expenditure of an additional \$2,000,000 for grade separation, with the further knowledge that any substantial increase in passenger traffic would lead to a further expenditure of many millions of dollars. These expenditures instead of affording an opportunity of improving railway service into Montreal would actually deteriorate it.

From the wider aspect of the city and travelling public the expenditure of money to enlarge the Windsor Street stub-end station and to force all railway passenger traffic entering the city, except from the west, to make a roundabout circuit to reach it, would be unjustifiable. On the other hand, the Central Station is well located to serve the requirements of the C.N.R. or of a union terminal if such should be decided upon. Expenditures upon it would at all times fit into the development of the city on broad regional lines and insure the handling of traffic in and out of the city with the greatest degree of expedition. It is perhaps not generally understood that, as compared with Windsor Street station, the use of the C.N.R. Central Station shortens the distances to northern, eastern and southern points.

The conclusion is unavoidable that to spend money at this time trying to adapt Windsor Street station to the larger requirements of the city would be unjustifiable, whereas money expended at present in accordance with the general plan which received the approval of Sir Frederick Palmer as being the best adapted to union terminal requirements, taking the long view, would be wisely expended. Sir Frederick summarized this aspect of the situation by stating that for various reasons, set out in detail in the report, "Windsor Street, besides having other disabilities, is not in reality a Union Station. The Tunnel site, on the other hand, possesses every attribute which a Central Station can have."

The plan of the Canadian National consists of more than the provision of a central passenger station which could be adapted as a union station. The plan is a solution of the problem of co-ordinating disconnected terminals of the Canadian National at the Tunnel terminal, Bonaventure and McGill Street, so that the operations can be carried on more satisfactorily than at present, and also to enable the railway to meet the growing industrial requirements of the city and alleviate the grade crossing problem to a great extent. Convenient and expeditious freight service, although not so noticeable as passenger service, is of even greater importance in aiding in the development of the city.

When the Bonaventure Station area has been relieved of passenger traffic, it will be possible to make much needed improvements in that

Hon. Mr. DANDURAND.