

you did not put the question in the regular way so that a division could be demanded by those who proposed the amendment. Therefore I say, in the procedure which you have followed there are two flaws: First of all, you did not say: 'I think the non-contents (or nays) have it; or, I think the 'yeas' have it; secondly, you did not put the question in French. Now it is absolutely necessary, it is absolutely essential by the rules of this House, that the question be put both in English and French. Of course if you began reading the motion in French we were at liberty to say: Dispense with reading in French. But you did not give us that opportunity. So nobody was under the impression that you had put the question in a manner that it might be voted upon. Now is it because there has been a misunderstanding between the speaker and this side of the House, is it because there is a mere quibble, is it because there is a mere technicality in the way, that you are going to deprive the opposition of the privilege of dividing upon this question and recording their votes upon it? I do not think so.

Sir WILFRID LAURIER. I think I was never so much impressed as I am now with the advantage of a dual language. There is certainly no desire on the part of the Speaker, I am sure, certainly no desire on the part of this side of the House to deprive the minority of any right or advantage they may have in this House. I thought myself they had no intention of dividing upon it, and that the Speaker was merely following the ordinary course. But if there has been a misunderstanding, and and if the minority desire to avail themselves of their right of dividing the House upon the question, for my part, if my hon. friend will withdraw his motion, I will be glad to ask the Speaker to take a division.

Mr. R. L. BORDEN. In view of what the Prime Minister said I will withdraw the motion.

Mr. SPEAKER. I agree with the hon. member for Montmorency (Mr. Casgrain) that it is the right of every member of the House to ask that the question be also put in French.

Mr. CASGRAIN. It is not necessary that any member should ask that it be put in French, the question should be put in French without its being asked.

Mr. TAYLOR. You are careful in every other motion that comes up, to read it in both languages.

Mr. SPEAKER. I suppose I have been lectured sufficiently for the time being. The question is now on the amendment of Mr. Clarke.

House divided on amendment (Mr. Clarke).

YEAS :
Messieurs

| | |
|--------------------|--------------------|
| Alcorn, | Kemp, |
| Armstrong, | Lancaster, |
| Barker, | LaRivière, |
| Bell, | Léonard, |
| Bennett, | MacLaren (Perth), |
| Birkett, | Maclean, |
| Blain, | McGowan, |
| Borden (Halifax), | Morin, |
| Boyd, | Osler, |
| Carscallen, | Pope, |
| Casgrain, | Puttee, |
| Clancy, | Richardson, |
| Clare, | Robinson (Elgin), |
| Clarke, | Roche (Marquette), |
| Cochrane, | Sherritt, |
| Donnelly, | Sproule, |
| Earle, | Taylor, |
| Gilmour, | Thomson (Grey), |
| Hackett, | Tolton, |
| Haggart, | Vrooman, |
| Henderson, | Ward, |
| Hughes (Victoria), | Wilmot, |
| Ingram, | Wilson.—47. |
| Kaulbach, | |

NAYS :
Messieurs

| | |
|--------------------------|------------------------|
| Bazinet, | Law, |
| Bickerdike, | LeBlanc, |
| Blanchet, | Loy, |
| Borden (Sir Frederick), | Macdonald, |
| Bourbonnais, | Mackie, |
| Brodeur, | MacLaren (Huntingdon), |
| Brown, | McCull, |
| Bureau, | McCreary, |
| Calvert, | McEwen, |
| Carbonneau, | McIsaac, |
| Copp, | McLennan, |
| Costigan, | Malouin, |
| Delisle, | Marcil (Bagot), |
| Demers (St. John), | Marcil (Bonaventure), |
| Douglas, | Matheson, |
| Fielding, | Mayrand, |
| Fisher, | Meigs, |
| Fitzpatrick, | Mignault, |
| Fortier, | Murray, |
| Gauvreau, | Parmelee, |
| Gibson, | Paterson, |
| Gould, | Préfontaine, |
| Haszard, | Reid (Restigouche), |
| Heyd, | Ross (Victoria, N.S.), |
| Hughes (King's, P.E.I.), | Sinclair, |
| Johnston (Cape Breton), | Smith (Vancouver), |
| Johnston (Lambton), | Stephens, |
| Kendall, | Sutherland (Oxford), |
| Lang, | Talbot, |
| Laurier (Sir Wilfrid), | Tolmie, |
| Laurier (L'Assomption), | Tucker, |
| Lavergne, | Turgeon, |
| (Drummond & Artha.), | Wallace.—66. |
| Lavergne (Montmagny), | |

PAIRS :

| Ministerial. | Opposition. |
|---------------------|--------------------|
| Ross (Ontario), | Hale, |
| Cowan, | Pringle, |
| Hyman, | Bruce, |
| Sutherland (Essex), | Northrup, |
| Beith, | Halliday, |
| Cartwright, | Tupper, |
| Christie, | Bail, |
| Dyment, | McCormick, |
| Erb, | Broder, |
| German, | Smith (Wentworth), |
| Grant, | Porter, |