

*Motions for Papers*

Then, later, in the course of the same debate, the minister made these remarks, as reported at page 6554. Again I quote:

The Department of Finance has made a detailed study of the expenditures and finds it can allocate approximately 40 per cent of gross federal expenditures to provinces by residence of recipient. This includes social security payments made directly to individuals, and various payments made to provincial governments and provincial institutions. Another 16 per cent of our expenditures can be roughly allocated by provinces on the basis of the location of the works on which they are spent or the service which they are spent or the service which they are used to provide. When these are eliminated this leaves about 44 per cent of the gross expenditures for items which cannot be said to be paid for the benefit of people in any particular province, and these can only be distributed arbitrarily, for example, on the basis of population.

Now, Mr. Speaker, I come to the very nub of the point raised by the hon. member for Lapointe. I quote again from the remarks of the Minister of Finance as reported on page 6554 of *Hansard* for August 7:

Time has only permitted the department to make a detailed study of this nature for the year 1961-62. We shall provide the details of these figures in answer to the questions to which I have referred.

I have read and reread the statement of the Minister of Finance during the debate on August 7, and nowhere can I find an undertaking by the Minister of Finance that he would put a parliamentary report before this house on matters relating to federal-provincial fiscal arrangements.

**Mr. Grégoire:** Mr. Speaker, would the hon. member agree to my putting on the record another statement from the same speech of the Minister of Finance which he has not quoted and which it is important should be quoted for the record? Would the hon. member accept another quotation—just five lines—from the same speech of the minister on the same day. He said:

*[Translation]*

The Department of Finance endeavoured to allocate fairly as much as it could of the federal revenues, by provinces, for the year 1961-62. This endeavour has been taking place over the last several months. I may say the departmental officials have been struggling with this problem for quite some time.

It is in that speech that the Minister of Finance said that for several months the officials of his department have been making an analysis and a distribution of federal receipts and expenditures amongst the provinces.

It is the report of that work carried out by the experts of the Department of Finance

[Mr. Pennell.]

to which the minister referred in his speech that we would like to have tabled in the house today.

*[Text]*

**Mr. Pennell:** Mr. Speaker, may I say that the quotation read by the hon. member does not disturb one bit the position I have taken on this matter; and again I point out that no reference is made by the minister to the fact that he would table any parliamentary report or reports such as this.

*[Translation]*

**Mr. Grégoire:** Mr. Speaker, on a point of order.

I never suggested that the Minister of Finance would table such a report. I said that such a report does exist, since the Minister of Finance himself referred to it in his speech of August 7.

I think the parliamentary secretary to the Minister of Finance should not distort my remarks. I never suggested that the Minister of Finance had undertaken to table that report, but that he had said that such a report did exist and that it would be tabled. That is a different thing.

*[Text]*

**Mr. Pennell:** I beg to differ with the hon. member for Lapointe and would refer to the precise words he used on October 28, yesterday, when he said, as reported at page 9515 of *Hansard*:

Mr. Speaker, the report we would like to have tabled is the one which the Minister of Finance (Mr. Gordon) promised October 7—

That is a direct allegation in the house that the Minister of Finance had promised such a report. As I said, I have read and reread the statement the Minister of Finance made on that occasion, and nowhere did he undertake or promise to the house that he would table a parliamentary report on this subject. Therefore, Mr. Speaker, I say that the position of the government has at all times been consistent on this matter. I might say that the hon. member for Lapointe was neither the first nor the foremost member of this house to raise this question because the right hon. Leader of the Opposition (Mr. Diefenbaker) brought this matter to the attention of the house a few days ago. At that time the question was dealt with by the Acting Minister of Finance, the Minister of Trade and Commerce (Mr. Sharp). This occurred on October 9 and the passage is to be found at