

ing typical questions, possibly no more examination papers in the University Library; and so these men were forced finally to resort each to his own inner consciousness; and as a happy result of their having been boon companions and college chums, and having been subjected to the same course of mental discipline, each of himself is enabled to evolve by independent mental processes no fewer than 8 questions; and so charmingly harmonious were these two mental machines in their working, that they gave forth the same questions in nearly the same order.

This line of argument was put forward in all seriousness as a proper defence, and accepted by the defenders of these men as perfectly satisfactory; if we were to meet with it in an ordinary novel, we would ridicule it as a caricature.

In addition to all this, Mr. Kirkland claims that he is able to foretell the questions of other examiners to even a greater degree than that shown above. He offered on the 5th day of the investigation before the commissioner, to prove that a greater similarity existed between his questions and the examination papers in 1877, than in any of the instances adduced; that is to say, Mr. Kirkland was prepared to show that he was able to guess more than 7 out of 9 questions of examination papers last July. It was shown, by the investigation into the examination frauds then perpetrated, that there were others who could do the same thing too.

Nor are we to take Mr. Kirkland's uncorroborated statement that he is able to foretell from 60 to 90 per cent. of the very questions another is going to ask. One of his own witnesses, who was brought all the way from Ottawa, and whose evidence was held as perfectly satisfactory—notwithstanding the fact that she wrote a letter a few days after appearing before the commissioner, in which she made statements completely contradicting her sworn testimony—stated that Mr. Kirkland, shortly before the close of the session in the summer of 1872, gave to the students of the Normal School a list of *14 questions that was found to cover the ground taken up by the examination paper*; and what makes it a hundred times more suspicious, she states that Mr. Kirkland said that *if they wrote out the answers to these questions, they would be able to answer the greater part of the examination paper*.

It is worthy of observation that the July examination paper more closely resembled Mr. Kirkland's list of questions than the June paper. A reason for this is not far to seek. The papers in June were set only for Normal School students, and were answered at the Normal School; the competition was only among Mr. Kirkland's own students; whereas the July papers were submitted to candidates from all parts of the Province, and the examinations took place simultaneously in the different counties, under the supervision of the Public School Inspectors and the County Board of Examiners. Normal School students competing at these examinations, coached by the miraculous foreknowledge of the science master of that institution, would be enabled to pass their examinations so creditably as to lead the examiners to inquire at what institution they had been so exceedingly well trained. Mr. Kirkland best knows whether this would tend and has tended to enhance his professional reputation and income or not. We shall leave the further criticism of the evidence until another time, only asking the reader to carefully compare the examination papers and Mr. Kirkland's questions, and form his own opinion as to the fairness of the statement, "that it would be difficult to vindicate the honesty with which the questions were selected for collating, except at the expense of the competency of the critic who undertook the task."