

But Mr. Balfour carries us much farther. After a lengthy and learned discussion of perception and experience, in which he refers to Aristotle, Hume, Berkeley and many other philosophers, he concludes thus: "The supreme act of instinctive faith involved in the perception of external objects stands quite unshaken. Whatever we may think of Berkeley, we cannot give up Dr. Johnson. 'Seeing,' says the proverb, 'is believing'; and it speaks better than it knows." Yes, the common sense of mankind declares that Berkeley was wrong; and, much more, Mrs. Eddy, who did not understand Berkeley, and went much further astray than he did. The world agrees with Dr. Johnson when he struck his foot against a stone that material is real.

Professor Robert Jardine, an eminent psychologist, in criticizing Berkeley, remarks as follows: "Thus Berkeley's most important conclusions regarding the non-existence of insensible matter, regarding the existence of infinite mind, regarding the nature of externality, and others, sprang from an erroneous view regarding the nature of ideas, and an indiscriminate application of the word 'idea' to things essentially different." This strikes at the very root of Bishop Berkeley's false position in philosophy; but it was wholly beyond Mrs. Eddy. She merely grasped the notion that he denied the existence of matter, but did not grasp his reasons, nor that he meant by "matter" the abstract idea of it apart from the qualities by which things are known.

Professor A. D. Lindsay, of Oxford, in discussing Berkeley's doctrine regarding pleasure and pain, remarks that "he begins by assuming that no one will assert that pain or pleasure exist apart from their being felt." This position Berkeley elaborates in his first dialogue between Hylas and Philonous. But where Berkeley made his fatal mistake in reasoning is that he did not recognize that pleasure and pain are states of the sense organs which come immediately into consciousness. When these states do not exist the sensations of pleasure and pain do not exist. This is the same as saying that when the sensation of pleasure and pain are not perceived these states do not exist in the sense organs. He confused a state with a quality. This is wholly different to the perception of the color and shape of an external object, such as an apple. It is because Berkeley failed to see this distinction that he made one of his chief errors, and also all his followers, including Mrs. Eddy, by using this position as an argument against the reality of matter, because of this false theory regarding pleasure and pain. Mrs. Eddy pushed this view to the extreme degree of the unreality of pain, holding that it was of the mind only, and consequently the origin of all pain and disease was from the mind.

It has now been made quite clear that Judge Smith cannot get any