

THE  
MANITOBA LAW JOURNAL.

VOL. I.

JULY, 1884.

No. 7.

REGINA v. HODGE.

THE decision of the Privy Council—that the Provincial Legislatures have power to impose the punishment of imprisonment *with hard labor*—has been sharply criticized by *The Canadian Law Times*, *The Legal News*, *The Law Journal* (Eng.) and *The Criminal Law Magazine*.

The two journals first named have each a preliminary objection to urge. Their criticisms will shew how impossible it is to please everybody or even all legal editors.

*The Canadian Law Times* finds fault as follows:—"If their Lordships of the Privy Council had confined themselves within the limits which they assigned themselves in giving judgment in this case, or if, at any rate, in overstepping their boundaries they had not transgressed the opinion of eminent authorities on criminal law, the judgment would have commanded more admiration and respect. The limits which they assigned themselves are those laid down by Hagarty, C. J. in another case, viz. 'That in all these questions of *ultra vires* it is the wisest course not to widen the discussion by discussions not necessarily involved in the decision of the point in controversy.' Now the constitutional question before the court was the right of the Legislature to create such a subordinate legislative body as the License Commissioners; the question whether the Legislature could