McGILL UNIVERSITY. MONTREAL. DEPARTMENT OF BOTANY FRANCIS E. LLOYD MACDONALD PROFESSOR OF BOTANY GARRIE M, DERICK PROFESSOR OF MORPHOLOGICAL BOTANY December 23, 1925 GEORGE W. SCARTH ASSISTANT PROFESSOR OF BOTANY Sir Arthur Currie, Principal and Vice Chancellor, McGill University. My dear Sir Arthur: -I have examined the article which you referred to me and which is returned herewith. The observations recorded are interesting but in some instances the deductions seem not to be wholly accurate. The various behaviors which the author describes are rather readily observable, so that in this regard he does not contribute to our knowledge. The apparent twining habit of individual fir trees is not without interest but I should want to look into the matter more closely before venturing an opinion as to the nature of this behavior, a very striking illustration of which appears in fig. 2 of his second paper. As a matter of fact, this field of thought is very difficult theoretically, and while general observations such as are supplied by Mr. Pemberton are always interesting, not very much is contributed to our knowledge thereby. In some cases, from the account, I am not even sure of the facts. I should not, however, on this account, wish to damp the ardor of one who has naturalist tendencies. With the compliments of the Season. I am. Faithfully yours, FEL/F