

the older rocks come out from beneath the Carboniferous system, we have a series of shaly and calcareous beds, consisting of two members. The Upper, and more calcareous and fossiliferous of the two, is of the same age with the Lower Helderberg of the New York geologists and the Ludlow of the English geologists. The Lower, more shaly and containing Graptolites, may be as old as the Clinton, the Upper Llandovery of England." In the following sentences the occurrence of similar fossils on the East River and at Earlton is indicated, and the several ages of the New Canaan and Nictaux series already stated are referred to. This paper was written in the summer of 1859, and was published in a Halifax newspaper, I suppose, in the winter of the same year. It appears that Dr. Honeyman had previously, in a paper which he calls his "debut" in writing on Nova Scotia geology, and dates April, 1859, asserted the Upper Silurian age of the Arisaig series, and on this ground has based very large claims with reference to Nova Scotia geology. I have not a copy of this paper, and do not remember its contents, if indeed I ever saw it; but on his testimony I have, both in my paper of 1860 and in the 2nd edition of *Acadian Geology* (page 566), acknowledged his prior publication, feeling, however, that the credit of establishing the age of these rocks on a firm basis belonged to Hall, and that Dr. H.'s reiterated assertion of his claims, coupled with sneers at my "supposed Devonian age" of these rocks, was, to say the least, in very bad taste. In truth, what we required at that time was not a mere opinion from any local geologist as to the age of these rocks, but a careful comparison by a palæontologist of the wide experience of Hall.

Here intervenes an unfortunate circumstance, on which Dr. H. dilates with evident pleasure, though he perfectly well knows the true explanation of it. In the masterly description of the Pictou coal-field by Logan and Hartley (*Reports of Geological Survey*, 1869), one of the most thorough geological investigations ever made in Nova Scotia; by some unexplained oversight, these authors referred to the older rocks, east of the East River, as Devonian, and gave my authority for this; although in my paper of 1860 and again in 1868 in *Acadian Geology*, I had described these rocks as Upper Silurian. Immediately on noticing this error, I mentioned it to Sir William, but this was not till after the publication of the Report. The rocks in question were not within the direct scope of Sir William's work at the time, and