

APPENDIX No. 2

loss, because I could see what was going on in Toronto, and I would certainly not advise any person to invest money in any enterprise in Toronto which will come into competition with the Hydro-Electric. This comes down to the question whether the Hydro-Electric should have a monopoly in the city of Toronto.

Hon. Mr. COCHRANE: You advocated yesterday that regulation and not competition in the case of the telephone companies was right.

Mr. CARVELL: No doubt whatever about that, not a particle, and if you will only follow it out you will come to the same conclusion, that the telephone and the electric light and power business are as far apart as the North Pole is from the South. Every man can use a telephone line, and only one can use the light line going into his house; You can regulate the light line, but you cannot the telephone, by competition. I will only say this that I know places in Canada where they would not put up with the service the people are getting from the Hydro-Electric for ten minutes.

Mr. BLAIN: I think there is no general complaint against it.

Mr. CARVELL: No, perhaps not, but I do not care about that. I want to point out to the Minister that the best regulation with regard to electric light and power is competition.

Mr. NESBITT: Or from any other business.

Mr. CARVELL: Excepting the telephone, because with regard to the telephones, a man does not want to be compelled to keep two telephones in his office in order to do business, and that is what it amounts to in a great many cases. It simply means that if you pass this amendment the city of Toronto has \$6,000,000 invested in the Hydro-Electric, and the city of Toronto will not allow this company any further extensions, and there is no public Utility Corporation in the world can exist unless they have the right to make extensions. If you compel the company to do business just as they are to-day, without extension you will drive them out of business in a few years. The result will be the handling of the business in the city of Toronto over to the Hydro-Electric. If the city of Toronto wants that, I have no objection to it, but I object to a clause being tacked on to the General Railway Bill applying only to the city of Toronto. I am unalterably opposed to this legislation taking away from men the value of money they have invested in good faith in this corporation.

Mr. MACDONELL: Is there any way to meet the case? I did not quite conclude the statement I intended to make when I was on my feet, but as to the point that you have raised, how can that be done? You cannot adopt safeguards, except in this way.

Mr. CARVELL: I have not given that matter very much consideration, I am only dealing with the Railway Act, and if people who have a grouch in any part of Canada have the right to come to Parliament when the general Railway Act is under consideration and have it amended to cover their particular case, what kind of a railway Act will you have in the course of a few years? I am not much of a monopolist, my views on that point are well known, but I do protest against taking away from any man a fair return on the money which he has invested on the strength of legislation passed by this Government. I believe in regulation. I believe it is fair that these people should go to the Railway Board, and I have absolute faith in the Railway Board, and I believe that the people of the city of Toronto will get better satisfaction if they will only leave this section as it is drafted by the draftsmen who have been charged with that duty. Let them go to the Railway Board. I only want again to say that if you pass this amendment and I judge from the attitude of the Minister that he intends to pass it, you are simply legislating these people out of existence, and giving the Hydro-Electric an absolute monopoly in that part of the province of Ontario.

Mr. MACLEAN: In answer to the argument of the honourable gentleman from New Brunswick, who says that we are interfering and confiscating the rights of individuals who have made investments—and he says the city of Toronto is doing that—I say that