

Excise Tax Act

Mr. Hamilton (Notre Dame de Grace): The proposed amendment, Mr. Speaker, is that this bill be not read a second time until further consideration has been given to a reduction in the excise tax on motor cars. I would refer you specifically to Beauchesne's fourth edition, citation 394, page 281, the first part of which states:

Nor may such an amendment deal with the provision of the bill upon which it is moved, nor anticipate amendments thereto which may be moved in committee, nor attach conditions to the second reading of the said bill.

It seems to me that this is specifically a condition which is attached to the second reading of the bill, that it be not read a second time until further consideration, and therefore the motion is directly contrary to this particular reference which says that such a motion shall not attach conditions to the second reading. I would, therefore, feel the motion is out of order.

Mr. Pickersgill: May I say a word on the point the hon. member has raised? The hon. member has suggested that this citation 394 governs this case. Surely, the amendment proposed by the hon. member for Fort William (Mr. Badanai) does not propose anything that could be done in committee. It proposes that a delay should take place in the second reading of this bill until such time as consideration is given to the matter of the motor tax. It does not propose anything specific.

May I also draw your attention to the provisions of Beauchesne's parliamentary rules and forms, fourth edition, citation 265, which is in these words:

No member other than a minister of the crown may introduce a bill for the reduction of duties. The government must take full responsibility for the taxation levied to provide the revenue. But the house enjoys—

I stress this respectfully to Your Honour.

—complete freedom to make every representation possible to the government with regard to the manner in which the ministers discharge this responsibility. This duty the members may perform by moving amendments to reduce the tax proposed by the administration.

Mr. Speaker: I thank hon. members for the help they have given me. As I see this amendment, it really is a declaration of a contrary principle to that which is under debate. The principle under debate is an amendment of the Excise Tax Act as the government has proposed. Now, the view which is brought forward is that the government has taken a wrong line and should have adopted another principle in amendment of the Excise Tax Act, that of reducing excise taxes instead of the tax with which it has dealt.

This is clearly not a matter which can be introduced as an amendment to the bill in

the course of its consideration in committee. I think that has already been decided. At the resolution stage an attempt was made to propose an amendment in this category, and it was properly ruled out. Nor can it be introduced into the bill when the bill is in committee of the whole, because the resolution does not cover an amendment of that kind. Here, where the principle on which the government has proceeded is under consideration, it seems to me this is a proper declaration of a contrary principle. I realize that there are some difficulties in accepting this point of view. Members may raise innumerable minor amendments to the Excise Tax Act as matters of principle, and of course that could not be acceptable to the house as it would delay proceedings endlessly. But in the view I take of it—I may not be correct in this but as advised I feel I am—I think I should put the amendment to the house. Is the house now ready for the question?

The house divided on the amendment (Mr. Badanai) which was negatived on the following division:

YEAS

Messrs:

Argue	Howard
Badanai	Macnaughton
Benidickson	McIlraith
Boivin	McMillan
Boulanger	McWilliam
Bourget	Martin (Timmins)
Bourque	Meunier
Brassard (Lapointe)	Mitchell
Cardin	Nixon
Caron	Pearson
Carter	Pickersgill
Chevrier	Racine
Crestohl	Ratelle
Denis	Regier
Deschatelets	Richard (Ottawa East)
Dumas	Richard (St. Maurice-Lafleche)
Godin	Roberge
Gour	Robichaud
Granger	Rouleau
Habel	Tucker
Herridge	Winch—43.
Houck	

NAYS

Messrs:

Aiken	Browne (Vancouver-Kingsway)
Allard	Brunsen
Allmark	Campbell
Anderson	(Lambton-Kent)
Asselin	Campbell (Stormont)
Baldwin	Campeau
Barrington	Cardiff
Baskin	Cathers
Beech	Chambers
Bell (Carleton)	Charlton
Bell (Saint John-Albert)	Chown
Belzile	Churchill
Best	Coates
Bigg	Comtois
Bissonnette	Cooper
Bourbonnais	Courtemanche
Brassard (Chicoutimi)	Creaghan
Browne (St. John's West)	