

Mr. POULIOT: The minister pays no attention to my explanation.

Mr. RALSTON: I submit that having done, as I think he has, a very grave injustice to the members of the other house and to a particular member of that house in that passage, I would have thought he would have unreservedly withdrawn any imputations of the kind.

Mr. POULIOT: Which I have done.

Mr. RALSTON: If the hon. member says he has done it—

Mr. POULIOT: Surely.

Mr. RALSTON: Then so far as I am concerned the incident is closed, but I understood my hon. friend to do almost everything but that.

Mr. POULIOT: That is most unfair and I protest, Mr. Chairman, on a question of privilege.

Mr. RALSTON: Do I take it, Mr. Chairman, that the hon. member does withdraw unqualifiedly any imputations against the senate or any members thereof?

Mr. POULIOT: I do not want my statements to be distorted by anyone.

Mr. RALSTON: I rise to a point of order.

Mr. POULIOT: I am on my feet, Mr. Chairman. How is it that I have to sit down when he rises?

Mr. RALSTON: I am rising to a point of order. I submit, Mr. Chairman, that this is a matter which is not debatable. The matter is before the Chair, and all I am saying is that if the hon. gentleman does withdraw unqualifiedly any imputations which he has made against the senate and its members, then so far as I am concerned the incident is closed. The remarks he has made about me do not disturb me in the least. But I submit that it is not a matter that we should debate.

Mr. POULIOT: I ask you, Mr. Chairman, if I have to withdraw twice?

The CHAIRMAN: No doubt the committee realizes that it is a delicate question to settle. Several arguments have been brought up by the Minister of National Defence (Mr. Ralston). An hon. member of this house has a right before the orders of the day are called or in committee to see that he is properly reported in *Hansard*. That is the privilege accorded to every member of parliament. The hon. member for Témiscouata has stated this evening that he did not use the word "shame" but that he used the word "useless." I feel

that the committee must accept the statement of the hon. member for Témiscouata on that point.

This afternoon I gave a ruling on the use of the word "nonentity" as applied to the senate, and the hon. member for Témiscouata withdrew that statement unequivocally as will be found in the record of *Hansard* for this afternoon.

The only question that is left as to which I am not absolutely satisfied in my own mind, although I listened very attentively to the hon. member for Témiscouata, is the allusion that he made this afternoon to a gentleman who was appointed to the senate, stating that he had received fat contracts. I listened very attentively to the hon. member's explanation this evening but that matter is still left on the border-line to some extent. Although I want to believe that he intended no reflection whatever on the character of the senate and of the senator that he had in mind—

Mr. POULIOT: Not at all.

The CHAIRMAN: —from the repeated statements made by the hon. member for Témiscouata that he has just made at this sitting, I believe I am voicing the sentiments of the majority of the committee when I say that his explanation should be accepted.

Some hon. MEMBERS: No.

The CHAIRMAN: Shall I report progress?

Some hon. MEMBERS: No.

Mr. RALSTON: I am only submitting this, that the statements to which I have referred are the hon. member's statements with regard to the senate having lost any usefulness and also its unwillingness to work, which simply means that members of the senate are there not only neglecting but unwilling to do their duty.

The CHAIRMAN: On that point the hon. member for Témiscouata has said this evening that he did not want to use the expression that the senate is useless.

Some hon. MEMBERS: Withdraw the whole statement.

The CHAIRMAN: I agree that the hon. member should withdraw it now.

Mr. POULIOT: I will bow to your decision, Mr. Chairman.

Mr. MACKENZIE (Vancouver Centre): Do I understand there is an unqualified withdrawal of all the aspersions of any kind whatsoever that have been made against the other house by the hon. member for Témiscouata?