

National Finance Committee

They are written for the minister's information and they are subject to his approval. Until they are approved by him or by the governor in council they must be regarded as unofficial. Todd, quoting Lord C. Paget, adds, at page 442:

The system of laying upon the table of the house reports from officers addressed to particular departments of the executive government is most objectionable.

He also quotes Disraeli, saying:

The house ought not to insist upon the production of papers and correspondence which concerned the preparation and preliminary consideration of measures; they would thereby put a stop to that freedom of criticism which was always invited on such occasions, and which contributed so much to the perfection of public measures. If the house were to insist upon the production of such documents, instead of the government getting what we get now, confidential reports containing the most minute details of the opinions of officers, given frankly and freely for the heads of departments, we shall have a system of reports framed for laying upon the table of the House of Commons.

Todd concludes, at page 440:

This principle is systematically recognized in all parliamentary transactions; were it otherwise, it would be impossible to carry on the government with safety and honour.

The minister, as reported at page 3696 of *Hansard*, said that he did not wish to produce these papers because in his judgment it was not in the public interest to do so. The responsibility is the minister's for making that statement. He is the best judge of the matter and the Chair must be bound by such a statement. I therefore rule that the document should not be tabled.

Mr. DORION: Do I understand, Mr. Speaker, that my motion is out of order? If so, I appeal from your ruling.

The house divided on the question: Shall the Speaker's decision be sustained? And the decision of the Chair was sustained on the following division:

YEAS

Messrs:

Abbott	Cruikshank
Authier	Dechene
Bertrand (Prescott)	Donnelly
Black (Chateauguay-Huntingdon)	Douglas (Queens)
Blair	Dupuis
Blanchette	Edwards
Bonnier	Emmerson
Bradette	Evans
Breithaupt	Farquhar
Casselman, Mrs. (Edmonton East)	Fauteux
Cleaver	Ferron
Cloutier	Fontaine
Corman	Fournier (Hull)
Coté	Fraser (Northumberland, Ont.)
	Furniss

[Mr. Speaker.]

Gardiner	MacLean (Cape Breton North-Victoria)
Gershaw	Macmillan
Gibson	McNevin (Victoria, Ont.)
Gingues	McNiven (Regina City)
Gladstone	Marier
Golding	Martin
Graham	Maybank
Grant	Mayhew
Gregory	Michaud
Hanson (Skeena)	Mitchell
Healy	Mullins
Henderson	Mulock
Howden	Mutch
Howe	Neill
Isley	Nixon
Isnor	O'Neill
King, Mackenzie	Pinard
Kirk	Poirier
Laflamme	Pottier
LaFleche	Purdy
Lafontaine	Ralston
Lalonde	Reid
Leclerc	Rennie
Leduc	Rhéaume
Leger	Rickard
Little	Ross (Calgary East)
Lizotte	Ross (Hamilton East)
McCann	Ross (Middlesex East)
McCuaig	Ross (Moose Jaw)
McCubbin	Ryan
McCulloch	St. Laurent
MacDiarmid	Sanderson
Macdonald (Brantford City)	Sissons
Macdonald (Halifax)	Soper
Macdonald (Kingston City)	Taylor
McDonald (Pontiac)	Telford
McGarry	Thauvette
McIlraith	Tomlinson
McIvor	Tripp
MacKenzie (Lambton-Kent)	Turgeon
MacKenzie (Neepawa)	Ward
Mackenzie (Vancouver Centre)	Warren
MacKinnon	Weir
(Edmonton West)	Whitman
McLarty	Winkler
	Wood—119.

NAYS

Messrs:

Adamson	Homuth
Anderson	Jakes
Bence	Johnston (Bow River)
Black (Cumberland)	Knowles
Black (Yukon)	Lacombe
Blackmore	McGregor
Bruce	MacInnis
Cardiff	MacKinnon (Kootenay East)
Casselman (Grenville-Dundas)	MacNicol
Castleden	Nielsen, Mrs.
Dorion	O'Brien
Esling	Perley
Fair	Pouliot
Fraser (Peterborough West)	Quelch
Gillis	Ross (St. Paul's)
Graydon	Ross (Souris)
Green	Roy
Hansell	Senn
Hanson (York-Sunbury)	Shaw
Hatfield	Stirling
Hazen	Stokes
	Wright—43.