

Mr. BRUCE: Mr. Speaker, I still maintain that I was referring to curtailment of the freedom of speech and that therefore I was perfectly within my rights as a member of this house.

Mr. McCANN: With reference to whom?

Mr. SPEAKER: Order. The hon. gentleman is referring to the curtailment of speech. He is entitled to state his views, but he must not, in referring to freedom of speech, refer to some other matter which has already taken place in the form of a debate in the other house.

Mr. BRUCE: Mr. Speaker, may I just quote an eminent Frenchman, Voltaire, who once said:

I disapprove of what you say, but I will defend to the death your right to say it.

I therefore wish only to have the same freedom in this house as they have in other parliaments of the world.

Mr. MACKENZIE (Vancouver Centre): Order.

Mr. GRAYDON: You just keep quiet. It is the Speaker's job to keep order, not yours. We cannot hear the debate for your cries of "order".

Mr. MACKENZIE (Vancouver Centre): You are the most frequent interrupter in the house.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am quite sure the hon. member for Parkdale—

Mr. MACKENZIE (Vancouver Centre): The leader of the opposition was not in the house when it happened.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am quite sure the hon. member for Parkdale (Mr. Bruce) does not intend to convey by his words that I have refused him permission to exercise his privilege of free speech within this house, but that is the only inference I can draw from his remarks. I must ask the hon. member to dissociate himself from any such meaning.

If the hon. member for Parkdale does not hear me distinctly I wish some of the hon. members would convey to him what I have just said.

Mr. CRUICKSHANK: Withdraw what you said.

Mr. HOMUTH: Withdraw nothing; what are you talking about?

Mr. SPEAKER: The hon. member for Parkdale does not hear me. I wish some of his colleagues would convey to him the

meaning of what I have already said to him, because I must ask that he should dissociate himself from any meaning that I might take as a reflection upon the Chair in that I am preventing him from exercising his right of free speech.

Mr. GRAYDON: Mr. Speaker, I just came into the house—

Mr. MACKENZIE (Vancouver Centre): Yes.

Mr. SPEAKER: Order. I am sorry to interrupt the leader of the opposition (Mr. Graydon), but I have already taken the position that the hon. member must withdraw the implication or the meaning which his words convey, namely, that I was exercising the rights of the Chair to prevent him from the right of free speech.

Mr. GRAYDON: Mr. Speaker, all that I wanted to say was this—

Some hon. MEMBERS: Order.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am always willing indeed to hear the leader of the opposition, but on this matter—

Mr. GRAYDON: I fail to see what this is all about and why I cannot say a word on the matter—

Mr. SPEAKER: In the meantime, the position so far as the Chair is concerned is distinct. I ask the hon. member for Parkdale to withdraw the meaning he implied in his remarks.

Mr. BRUCE: I had no intention of implying that Your Honour had been unfair. I meant only to say that when a man is punished for exercising his undoubted right of freedom of speech in this parliament, then I think it is time that somebody should speak up for him. I would have expected that the leader of this house, who has always been so careful about the privileges of parliament, would have said something in this regard before now, but nothing has been said. That is pretty nearly all I had intended to say. It does seem to me and to others that men who are outside this parliament should not have a right to punish members of either house for something they say in the house. We have had an illustration of that happening within recent days. It is against that method of interfering with freedom of speech that I wish to protest in the strongest terms possible, and it is only because of that that I have intervened in this debate this evening.