

Question of Privilege

Mr. Speaker: I am sorry to interrupt the hon. member, but we are discussing a point of privilege.

Mr. Diefenbaker: No, Mr. Speaker. On a question of order, the minister made gratuitous remarks—

Mr. McIlraith: To you.

Mr. Diefenbaker:—and the former minister of transport has the right to reply.

Mr. Speaker: I appreciate the comments of the right hon. Leader of the Opposition, but this point of privilege has almost developed into a debate on both sides of the house. It is my duty to try to bring it to a conclusion and reach a decision as to whether the motion is in order. I think the extended discussion this morning almost proves the point that we are anticipating a grievance or a debate. For example, citation 113 in Beauchesne's fourth edition says:

Members often raise so-called "questions of privilege" on matters which should be dealt with as personal explanations or corrections, either in the debates or the proceedings of the house. A question of privilege ought rarely to come up in parliament. It should be dealt with by a motion giving the house power to impose a reparation or apply a remedy.

Well, we have a motion in front of us, which I am glad to say is the customary procedure, and I wish it were followed more often. But it has to be decided whether this motion is in order. In my opinion the hon. member for Winnipeg North Centre could easily put a notice on the order paper asking for the production of papers. At that time the government could make up its mind whether to accede or not. In the light of these circumstances, and in the light of the extended discussion this morning, I regret to say I do not see a prima facie question of privilege on this matter.

Mr. Knowles: With respect, Mr. Speaker—I know I cannot argue at this point—but in view of what has been done to parliament in this matter, I must appeal your decision.

Mr. Speaker: The house has heard the decision of the Chair from which the hon. member for Winnipeg North Centre has appealed to the house. All those in favour of sustaining the decision of the Chair will please say yea.

Some hon. Members: Yea.

Mr. Speaker: Those opposed will please say nay.

Some hon. Members: Nay.

Mr. Speaker: In my opinion the yeas have it.

And more than five members having risen:

Mr. Speaker: Call in the members.

[Mr. Balcer.]

Mr. Speaker put the question as follows:

The question before the house is an appeal from a ruling of the Chair, which is as follows:

The hon. member for Winnipeg North Centre rose on a question of privilege and proposed a motion as follows:

"That in the opinion of this house the government should give immediate consideration to the question of making public the contents of the report of R. Dixon-Speas and Associates on the economic operations of Trans-Canada Air Lines."

I stated that in my opinion the hon. member could put a motion on the order paper in order to permit the house to take a decision on the question. That being so, I ruled that there was not a prima facie question of privilege in regard to the proposed motion; whereupon the hon. member for Winnipeg North Centre appealed to the house from this decision.

The house divided on the question: Shall the Speaker's decision be sustained? And the decision of the Chair was sustained on the following division:

YEAS

Messrs:

Armstrong	Hellyer
Asselin (Notre Dame de Grace)	Klein
Asselin (Richmond-Wolfe)	Lachance
Badanai	Laing
Batten	LaMarsh, Miss
Bechard	Lamontagne
Benidickson	Lamoureux
Benson	Laniel
Berger	Laverdiere
Boulanger	Loiselle
Byrne	Macdonald
Cameron (High Park)	MacEachen
Cardin	McIlraith
Caron	McMillan
Carter	Martin (Essex East)
Cashin	Matheson
Chevrier	Matte
Cote (Chicoutimi)	Moreau
Cote (Longueuil)	Morison
Cowan	Mullally
Cyr	Munro
Deachman	Nicholson
Deschatelets	Nixon
Drouin	Olson
Drury	Ouellet
Dube	Pearson
Dupuis	Pepin
Emard	Pickersgill
Ethier	Regan
Eudes	Richard
Favreau	Rinfret
Forest	Rochon
Francis	Rouleau
Garland	Roxburgh
Gelber	Ryan
Gendron	Sharp
Godin	Stewart
Gordon	Tardif
Gray	Teillet
Greene	Temple
Groos	Tremblay
Guay	Tucker
Habel	Turner
Haidasz	Wahn
Hahn	Watson (Chateauguay-Huntingdon-Laprairie)
Hays	Whelan—92.