

against that of the Government engineer as to this proposed route, but he did not know if Mr. Shanly had ever passed over the line adopted by the Government. Certainly a route which was mountainous, even if considerably shorter than a more level route, would prove more troublesome and expensive, and one to be avoided. The supposed superior advantages of the North Shore route should be demonstrated before hostile criticisms were passed upon the route Government had chosen. He believed they were justified in taking a different view from that of the last speaker, and the reports of the engineers to the Government could not justify the adoption of the line indicated by the last speaker.

HON. MR. BELLEROSE said he seemed to have been misunderstood. He had stated the projected route from Georgian Bay to Renfrew was certainly, geographically speaking, the shorter route, and, if so, other considerations apart, Government would have been justified in choosing it. But he (Mr. B.) also asserted that there were reports before us, from Messrs. Shanly and Legge, shewing that, though geographically, it was shorter, in an engineering point of view, the other route, the North Shore, by the Mattawa, was, practically, the shorter by thirty to forty miles. (Hear, hear, from Hon. Mr. Campbell.) He did not care whether the Hon. Minister of Agriculture hailed from Quebec or Ontario. His (Mr. Bellerose's) object was to show by argument that the public good, the general interest of all the Provinces, required the choice of another route. Whatever Sir George Cartier's opinions as to this Upper Ottawa route were, he did not care. It was because he (Mr. B.) had seen by a report that the Premier had selected the route from Renfrew to Georgian Bay, promising Government assistance, that he appealed to Ministers from Quebec to do something—not simply for the benefit of Quebec in this matter, but for the good of the whole Confederation. If we did not adopt the shortest and best line, the trade we might enjoy would pass to the United States. (Hear, hear.)

HON. MR. CAMPBELL said he did not think the country clearly under-

stood the object of the Government in constructing this Georgian Bay and Nipissing branch. For forty-five to fifty miles they would be in the middle of the forest, away from business and settlements. He was quite at a loss to know their object. The Secretary of State said it was to connect Lake Nipissing with a road the Government proposed to subsidise from Renfrew or Pembroke to that point. But it did not follow that, because Government proposed to subsidise that road, it would be built. That event would depend upon the feeling of the money market, and a hundred things over which Government had no control whatever. In the absence of the contemplated continuation eastwards, in what condition would the country be with a branch on its hands, constructed from a remote point in the woods, and carried thence to Georgian Bay? The scheme was not in pursuance of the plan Government originally adopted, which was a part land and water communication to British Columbia, or the Far West; and, as pointed out by the hon. gentleman who introduced the subject, there were already railroads to Georgian Bay. What object would a passenger from the Far West, landed, for example, at the mouth of French River, or one of the points on Georgian Bay, now in connection with different parts of Ontario, gain by the proposed Government road? Why should this branch be constructed in the absence of any means of getting away from Nipissing when you reach there from the West? The Government had no assurance of the building of a road eastward, for example, even in the event of a subsidy. This proposed branch was not a portion of the essential line of communication with the Far West. That from Thunder Bay to Shebandowan was essential, adopting the Government's theory of a mixed land and water route, as would be any other section of a railway to navigable water. It would be time enough to construct the Georgian Bay branch if the road from the Upper Ottawa to Nipissing was commenced or nearly completed. If Messrs. Shanly and Legge had reported that the North Shore branch, by the Mattawa, was practically the shorter, then, apparent-