

" At the close of the Hon. Minister's address Mr. Caldwell expressed the opinion that the work which was done last year in the improvement of the Pension Act had been, to some extent, nullified by the Senate.

" Mr. Carroll stated that there was an impression that the Pension Act had been changed in the Department after it had passed the House of Commons. This Dr. Béland denied. He had heard such a rumour, but it was not so. As a matter of fact there had been a verbal change which did not in any way affect the Bill, but this was all".

If the reports of this Committee are going to be a sort of Hansard, and the remarks of members of the Committee reported, I think that the remarks by all members should be reported. I remember making a few short remarks myself, not any more than Mr. Carroll or Mr. Caldwell. I do not think it is fair to confine the reporting to remarks made by supporters of the Government; I do not think it should be a hand-picked report, and the report as published on page 4 of this proceeding is such a report. We should have a complete Hansard if we are going to have any.

The CHAIRMAN: Mr. Black, you are absolutely right. I will give an explanation to the Committee as to what happened at the first sitting. I was elected Chairman at that sitting but I had nothing to do before these proceedings began and it was only during the course of the sitting that we learned that a verbatim report was not being prepared, and I was informed that a ruling had been made by the Speaker by which only evidence should be reported. In my opinion that was a little too rigid, and if that ruling had been strictly followed nothing at all would have been reported at the first meeting, because there was no evidence taken. Hon. Mr. Béland, the Minister, had made a statement which I thought should be printed, and while I had no desire for self-advertising, I thought my remarks of appreciation of the soldiers and their work should be placed on record, so when I found these had not been reported I had the proceedings arranged as best I could by the Clerk of the Committee, but these reports are not verbatim reports.

Mr. BLACK (Yukon): Don't understand me to object to what you said being printed. That is not my purpose. It was very eloquently spoken and well worthy of printing as was also the statement made by the Minister, but what purports to be a report of what was said afterwards by the members of the Committee is not complete. I do not think it should be there at all, unless it is a complete report. If we are going to do this, let us do it correctly.

The CHAIRMAN: Absolutely. I was coming to that point. There was a summary of what Dr. Béland said which was prepared as well as possible, and the remarks to which Mr. Black objects were prepared by the Clerk of the Committee. I do not wish to waive my responsibility for these being placed in the report, and I will say that a ruling will be given to-day that everything shall be taken down, and I will see the Speaker about it and ask him for a ruling by which full justice will be given to every member of the Committee.

The SECRETARY: Mr. Chairman, I am responsible for the last part of this report to which Mr. Black has referred and if there is anything that has been omitted we could have it inserted in the next day's proceedings; so, if Mr. Black and others who made remarks at the last meeting will give us a copy of what they wish printed it can be included as an errata to the proceedings in question.

Mr. BLACK (Yukon): What I said was not worthy of being printed, as were the remarks of the Chairman and the Minister. What I did say was to agree with Mr. Caldwell that we need not be too pessimistic in regard to the workings under former conditions and that I thought we had accomplished a great deal and that we should not be discouraged as to the result of our work. That was neither here nor there, but if we are going to make a report of such chance remarks, let us make a complete report.