

Mr. Lewis: Mr. Speaker, that was the way I noticed it.

Mr. Horner (Crowfoot): That is not the way it was said.

Mr. Alexander: You noticed in error.

Mr. Lewis: The hon. member may speak for his—

Mr. Lundrigan: Mr. Speaker, a question of privilege.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order, please. What is the question of privilege?

Mr. Lundrigan: Mr. Speaker, I was in the House this afternoon and the House did not give consent to the motion made by the hon. member for Winnipeg North Centre (Mr. Knowles) but certainly no members were named as having refused consent. I challenge the hon. member to state categorically who refused consent or get on with the problem.

Mr. Lewis: Mr. Speaker, let not the hon. member try to be so smart. There was not anyone from the other side of the House who cried "No" and there was not anyone from my party who cried "no". The Speaker heard the "no" so I ask you, Mr. Speaker, to decide exactly where that "no" came from.

I stayed, Mr. Speaker, to listen—

Mr. Lundrigan: Mr. Speaker—

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order, please. The hon. member for York South (Mr. Lewis) has the floor. I do not believe a question of privilege is involved in what I have heard so far. The hon. member for York South.

Mr. Lundrigan: Mr. Speaker, I rise on a question of privilege.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The hon. member for York South is recognized by the Chair.

Mr. Lundrigan: Mr. Speaker, I rise on a question of privilege.

Mr. Lewis: I waited, Mr. Speaker, to hear the hon. Leader of the Opposition (Mr. Stanfield)—

Mr. Lundrigan: Mr. Speaker, surely a question of privilege, when raised, must be heard immediately.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The hon. member rose on a question of privilege. It was heard and disposed of, and then he mentioned a further question of privilege. I am not sure how one could arise but I will be patient and hear the hon. member on a further question of privilege.

Mr. Lundrigan: Mr. Speaker, I have the greatest respect for you, Sir, but I will say that if I want to raise 50 questions of privilege you are called to judge those—

Some hon. Members: Order, order!

Mr. Lundrigan: The hon. member for York South (Mr. Lewis) has made an accusation which is incorrect. As a matter of fact, the hon. Leader of the Opposition accepted the challenge and, consequently, there was no reluctance

25789—3½

Supply

on his part to express in detail the opposition of this party on old age pensions or he would not have taken the opportunity to do it this afternoon. Consequently, when the charge is made the hon. member must withdraw his remarks. I am not going to sit here as a member of this party and allow smear tactics by the hon. member for York South which have no basis in fact and can only downgrade his party. I should like to see him start to act like an hon. member instead of a dishonourable member, as is the case at the moment.

Some hon. Members: Hear, hear!

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Perhaps this sustains the Chair's suspicion—

Some hon. Members: Hear, hear!

Mr. Deputy Speaker:—that we are really dealing with a question of debate rather than a question of privilege. The Chair would remind the hon. member for Gander-Twilligate (Mr. Lundrigan) that he has an opportunity to take part in the debate. If somebody has said something with which he finds fault or if there is a disagreement on fact, rather than interrupting another hon. member's speech he should make his own contribution with his own statement of the facts as they appear to him. I am sorry to have been somewhat impetuous earlier in trying not to see the hon. member for Gander-Twilligate a second time, but I think it does become an abuse of our procedures if every time an hon. member says something with which some other hon. member disagrees, violently or otherwise, an attempt is made to settle the difference then and there by means of a question of privilege. I really believe this is a bad debating practice, and I have to appeal to all hon. members to assist the Chair in seeing that the debate proceeds in a more orderly fashion.

Some hon. Members: Hear, hear!

Mr. Hees: Mr. Speaker—

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The hon. member for Prince Edward-Hastings (Mr. Hees) rises on a question of privilege.

Mr. Hees: Mr. Speaker, the allegation the hon. member for York South made was 100 per cent untrue. Mr. Speaker, he has said, sitting at the far end of the chamber, that he could ascertain exactly whether every member on the far side, a long, long distance from him, said yes or no.

Some hon. Members: Order, order!

Mr. Hees: He is saying no one said no. I say to him he is stating a straight untruth and he knows it.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Perhaps the hon. member for Prince Edward-Hastings was not here when I made my point a few minutes ago—

Some hon. Members: Hear, hear!

Mr. Deputy Speaker:—on questions of privilege which are really matters of debate, and trying to set forth one's own opinion of what transpired. I appeal to hon. members not to raise bogus points of order or questions of privilege