

## CRITICAL NOTE.

BY ERNEST E. T. SETON.

I am a little surprised to see Mr. Chamberlain renew his strictures on my Thrush Paper, and with an uncalled for asperity which gives his note the appearance of an attack rather than a critique.

In replying I will begin by admitting that I have made some errors,—one a serious one, in relation to the ranges of the species. I confess I have no personal knowledge of the distribution of birds in the Maritime Provinces, and have been led astray by misinterpretation of the phrase 'Eastern North America.' No doubt Mr. Chamberlain is right in his corrections so far as the maritime provinces are concerned. In future he will find me less loose in my statements; though, by the way, consultation of a map will show them to be more nearly correct than he allows, for the language used was general, and is only erroneous when unfairly applied to the remote corners of the district.

Next, Mr. Chamberlain says I am wrong in saying 'the Bluebird reaches the maritime provinces about the end of March,' not because its date is earlier or later but because '*it is exceedingly rare there.*'

He says '*I am not prepared to say that the Gnatcatcher has not been taken in Nova Scotia etc.,*' but he does say it, in the form of an inference. It was given on the authority of Mr. Allen.

These objections can only be characterized as hypercritical in the extreme. Lastly, Mr. Chamberlain says I omit the Gray-Checked Thrush altogether. He forgets that I promised that we should adhere to Dr. Coues as our authority, and that gentleman maintains the bird to be a mere variety of the Swainson's Thrush. Therefore it is not omitted.

He says the Veery is *not* the commonest of the Thrushes. I distinctly spoke with reference to Canada generally and I repeat the statement that the Veery is the commonest of the Woodthrushes.

He says the Thresher is confined to Southern Ontario. I reply that it is abundant in Northern Ontario as far as the great watershed north of Lake Nipissing, (Dr. Brodie, Dr. White) and probably farther, as it is one of the commonest birds of Manitoba.

These last three statements by Mr. Chamberlain are more than mistakes, they are unpardonable blunders, coming as they do in the form of a gratuitous attack.