

Mr. STEVENS: I happen to know the case to which the hon. gentleman refers. I may say that a lawyer made a trip to Ottawa, pleaded the appeal to the Supreme Court, and never received a dollar for it.

Mr. BICKERDIKE: That was because the man was poor.

Mr. STEVENS: Not at all. The expenses were more than \$600 in this very case.

Mr. BICKERDIKE: Will the hon. gentleman tell me if he knows the case of a single wealthy man who was hanged in Canada?

Mr. STEVENS: Plenty of them.

Mr. BICKERDIKE: I challenge the hon. member or the Minister of Justice to give me the name of one wealthy man hanged in Canada during the last fifteen years.

Mr. DOHERTY: Will the hon. gentleman give me the name of one wealthy man convicted of murder and sentenced to be hanged, whose sentence was commuted?

Mr. BICKERDIKE: Yes, if the hon. gentleman wants it.

Mr. W. H. BENNETT: I can give the hon. gentleman an instance from the county of Simcoe. A man named Carruthers was hanged there; he was a well-to-do farmer. Two or three K.C.'s were employed to defend him; an enormous amount of money was spent in his defence.

Mr. BICKERDIKE: The minister challenged me to give one name; I mention the case of a man named Shortis, of Valleyfield.

Mr. DOHERTY: That was before my time.

Mr. BICKERDIKE: I am not blaming the hon. minister for this. I do not think he is a bit worse than his predecessors; perhaps he is not as bad as some of them. In regard to the case to which I was referring, most people at that time thought, and still are of the opinion, that this man's sentence ought to have been commuted to imprisonment for life. The Minister of Justice certainly would not have suffered any loss of dignity if he had done that. But he did not do so. He made doubly sure, and did what was done in some other countries fifty years ago—gave the prisoners the benefit of the doubt and hanged them both.

Capital punishment has been enforced among all nations from the earliest times. The agitation against it, which began in

[Mr. Bickerdike.]

the eighteenth century and continued throughout the nineteenth, led to its abolition in many European countries and in several states of the United States. Michigan abolished capital punishment in 1846, Rhode Island in 1852; Wisconsin, 1853; Maine, 1887; Kansas, 1907; Minnesota, 1911; Philippine Islands, 1911; Washington, 1913; Oregon, 1914; North Dakota, 1915; Tennessee, 1915; South Dakota, 1915. The minister will see, therefore, that the states of the United States are gradually one after the other, abolishing capital punishment. Any country that retains the death penalty on its statute book in this Christian era has simply legislated the word "not" out of the commandments. Public bodies are at the present time passing resolutions all over this country demanding this reform. Bodies of organized labour are passing resolutions all over the Dominion asking that the death penalty in Canada be abolished. Within the last three weeks a gathering of several thousand people in Ottawa passed a resolution asking that capital punishment be abolished in Canada.

And they are going further; they are teaching their children to sing the new song, they are hanging men in Canada because they are poor. I know of sheriffs in the province of Quebec who are so conscientious over this matter that, in case they should be called upon at any time in the absence of the regular hangman to perform the duties of executioner, they have their resignations written out and are ready to hand them in to the authorities rather than become legalized murderers.

A very prominent statesman in the New York Legislature on one occasion suggested that Canada might well adopt what he claimed to be their more modern and humane system of getting rid of their criminals by electrocution. Now, Sir, can any man imagine discussing a humane method of taking his fellow man's life? This statesman claimed that the State of New York had adopted electrocution as a result of the onward march of Christianity and civilization, but I pointed out that, after all is said, the final result is much the same. In the olden days, it was true, the State of New York burned their criminals at the stake until dead, and to-day they burn them in the chair until dead, and this is upheld by some of these eminent jurists to be the advancement of Christianity and civilization.

Now, in Canada for three years, 1911, 1912 and 1913, there were sixty-five death sen-