

Accordingly, since I am satisfied on the ground of relevancy, and since the foregoing precedents support the proposition that, assuming relevancy, it may be moved that the substantial words of an amendment be struck out and others substituted, I must allow the proposed sub-amendment to stand.

I should perhaps add that I do not consider that the sub-amendment constitutes either a direct or an expanded negative of the main amendment, since as I indicated earlier it is broad enough to include the subject-matter of the main amendment. Nor do I consider that it could properly be alleged, against the sub-amendment, that its effect is unfair in that it will prevent a vote on the main amendment. If that were a ground of objection, no sub-amendment could ever be moved; for, if the sub-amendment carried, and the amendment, as amended, carried, there could obviously be no vote on the amendment itself under any circumstances. By the same token, the "six months' hoist", or a motion under Beauchesne's Third Edition, Citation 657, if carried, would have the practical effect of preventing a vote on the motion for the second reading of a bill. Mr. Speaker Lemieux commented succinctly on this question on March 22, 1926 (see Journals, House of Commons, Vol. 43, 1926, p. 170), when he said:—

"It cannot be contended that such a practice (i.e., of moving a sub-amendment which has the effect of preventing a vote on the main amendment) is unfair. After all, in the last analysis, the decision of the House is supreme. As long as Mr. Stevens has asserted his right to express his views by making his amendment, he suffers no prejudice if Mr. Woodsworth using the same right submits a sub-amendment asking the House to accept an alternative proposition."

And after still further Debate thereon, the question being put on the said proposed amendment to the proposed amendment, it was agreed to, on the following division:—

YEAS

Messrs.

Anderson,	Cannon,	Dickey,	Harrison,
Arsenault,	Carroll,	Dion,	Healy,
Ashbourne,	Carter,	Dumas,	Hellyer,
Balcom,	Cauchon,	Eudes,	Helme,
Bater,	Chevrier,	Eyre,	Henderson,
Beaudoin,	Claxton,	Ferrie,	Henry,
Benidickson,	Cleaver,	Follwell,	Hetland,
Blanchette,	Cloutier,	Fournier (Hull),	Hosking,
Blue,	Corry,	Fulford,	Hunter,
Boisvert,	Côté (Matapedia-	Garland,	James,
Boivin,	Matane),	Garson,	Jeffery,
Bonnier,	Côté (Saint-Jean-	Gauthier	Jutras,
Boucher,	Iberville-	(Lac-Saint-Jean),	Kirk (Antigonish-
Bradette,	Napierville),	Gauthier (Lapointe),	Guysborough),
Bradley,	Côté (Verdun-	Gauthier (Portneuf),	Kirk (Digby-
Breithaupt,	La Salle),	Gauthier (Sudbury),	Yarmouth),
Breton,	Crestohl,	George,	Lafontaine,
Brisson,	Croll,	Gibson,	Laing,
Brown (Essex West),	Cruikshank,	Gingras,	Langlois (Berthier-
Bruneau,	Dechene,	Gour (Russell),	Maskinongé),
Byrne,	Decore,	Gourd (Chapleau),	Langlois (Gaspé),
Cameron,	Demers,	Gregg,	Lapointe,
Campney,	Dewar,	Harris (Grey-Bruce),	Lefrançois,