

THE BATTLEFIELD CONTROVERSY

MR. P. B. CASGRAIN, past-president of the Literary and Historical Society of Quebec, joins issue with Mr. Arthur G. Doughty as to the conclusions of his paper on *The probable Site of the Battle of the Plains of Abraham*, published in the recently issued volume of the *Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada*, and referred to at some length in the first number of *North American Notes and Queries*. Exception is taken to so large a number of the minor details of Mr. Doughty's paper that it would be both tedious and unprofitable to take them up seriatim. The map published in the present number was prepared for the purpose of accompanying and supporting the contention of Mr. Casgrain in regard to the site of the battle, and in his reply to Mr. Doughty's proposition. It will prove both interesting and useful for purposes of comparison with that supplied by Mr. Doughty and published with the first number of *North American Notes and Queries*.

If there are many minor and unimportant details connected with the battle and the movements that preceded it, upon which Messrs. Casgrain and Doughty have agreed to differ, it is quite clear that upon some of the more vital points affecting the discussion of the site of the battle, they are perfectly in accord. Mr. Doughty's main contention is that the battle of the 13th September 1759 was not fought on any part of the so-called Plains of Abraham now known as the race-course property. Just how little exception is taken to this main proposition of Mr. Doughty's by Mr. Casgrain is shown in the following statement made by the latter.—“The opening of the battle on the English side took place when and after they had advanced on the eminence of the jail, where they awaited the fire of the enemy; and on returning the fire and charging, the fight extended thence to the walls of the town and down the valley of the St. Charles to the bridge of boats.” Mr. Doughty, it is true, places the opening of the fight a few hundred feet nearer to the city than Mr. Casgrain does, and declines to admit the latter's claim that there were marching and line of battle formations on the present race-course property.

These minor details furnish a wide battle ground for the antiquarians, while the general reader is principally interested in learning where the fateful