

stigma black, paler at their juncture; marginal cross-nervure strongly bowed, received by the third submarginal cell at its apical two-thirds; inner spur of the anterior tibiæ with an oblique prolongation on the side. Length, 13 mm.

Habitat.—Franconia, New Hampshire.

Closely related to *barnstonii*, Kirby, from which it is separated by having the collar and tegulæ yellow.

#### IN REPLY TO MR. HULST.

BY A. R. GROTE, A. M., BREMEN, GERMANY.

Mr. Hulst has been at the pains of taking a sentence of mine as the text of a discourse as to the value of genitalic characters in classification, in the January number of the CANADIAN ENTOMOLOGIST. Whether this sentence will really bear the edifice Mr. Hulst has erected upon it, is a matter which hardly concerns me. Before either Mr. Smith or Mr. Hulst wrote, I had pointed out the value of the genitalia in generic groupings, in this following Lederer, as an accessory character. My opinion had been (but this is only an opinion) that morphologically the characters drawn from the male anal appendages were of similar value to those drawn from the antennæ. I either did not hear, or had forgotten, Prof. Fernald's unprinted paper on the classification of the Tortricidæ. As I took the greatest interest in Prof. Fernald's studies, it is more than probable I did not hear it. If the sub-family *Phycitinae* can be divided into two groups or tribes from a decided modification of the genitalia, I think there would be no objection to its use, except that the character is difficult of verification. I would ask Mr. Hulst how he comes to classify species, of which he only knows the female, with such certainty in his paper? But this and other questions as to Mr. Hulst's classification are a matter for M. Ragonot to consider, and those who especially interest themselves in the study of the *Phycitinae*. My sentence has another origin and meaning which I will illustrate. During a visit Mr. Smith paid me on Staten Island, he pointed out to me that the legs of our *Catocala* were differently spined in the different species. I had not observed this. Shortly afterwards we had a new paper by Mr. Hulst on *Catocala*, illustrated by Mr. Smith, in which the species were strangely jumbled on the strength of this character. In fact, Mr. Hulst went so far as to count the number of spines on the joints to found his divisions. [Compare Bull. Brook. Ent. Soc., III. and VII., 31.] In the American Naturalist will be found a