

when they leave they do not make servants and as a rule they go back to the wild state. In very many cases I fear they are worse than if they had never been in the industrial school. We are spending an immense amount of money and we are doing little good with it. If there is anything that gets in to the Indian it may be a little percolation of religious teaching through the missionaries who build up their moral character somewhat, but when they go back amongst their own people, it is difficult to keep any supervision over them, and I am afraid that even permanent results in that respect are pretty hard to measure. Is it not time we did something else for the Indian? Should we longer spend half a million dollars a year without results? Should we not get some active agency at work to investigate this whole question and give us the result of ripened experience, pointing out our mistakes in the past and blazing out a pathway for us in the future? Unless we can educate our Indians in a line towards strengthening an esprit de corps among them and opening up a future career for them for which they are adapted, it seems to me it is almost better that we should leave them their natural state where they do a little hunting and a little fishing and a little agriculture and pass their lives in as good a way as they do now after all the money we spend on their education under our present system. It seems to me it would be better for us to leave them as they are in their simple habits and prevent them from being imposed upon by the white man, or else that we should adopt some other system which after they leave the school may fit them for useful occupation. You cannot make a white man out of an Indian and there is no use our trying that. Give the Indian boy a fair education, instill something of purposes and ambition in him and offer to him some sort of useful career. They ought to make splendid fire rangers and forest rangers and scouts. Is there any inherent disability in the Indian character which makes it impossible for them to do that kind of work? Is there no kind of police duty they can do? In the United States they do utilize the Indians in various ways, they make men out of them, not white men it is true, but they instil in the Indians a good deal of nerve and verve and they are fairly successful in several spheres. Is it not time that Canada should do something? The Indians are our wards it is said, and we should do the square thing by them. But, we ought not go on spending a lot of money, pretending to do something and really doing nothing, and coming around this table every year and nodding to each other and all acknowledge we have failed. I would go in very strongly for appointing a commission, not a

partisan commission, but the very best men we can get, to inquire into and to recommend to us the best means for the moral, mental, technical, and industrial education of our Indians. Canada will find the money for that; Canada has never balked at doing her duty by the Indians. We may have taken their lands, sometimes when we should not, but we have always protested our intention to treat them fairly and I believe we have endeavoured to do so.

Mr. OLIVER. There is no question at all but that the intention of the people of Canada is to deal fairly by the Indians, and that is one reason the House has voted from year to year a large sum of money for Indian education without inquiring too closely as to the results. The people of Canada feel there is an obligation resting on them with respect to the Indians and the people of Canada have been quite willing to discharge that obligation. What my hon. friend (Mr. Foster) has said about the desirability of bettering the conditions so that there shall not be what appears a waste of money is something in which we can all agree. We are not negligent in the matter but we have to deal with a problem which has never yet been solved. It has not been solved in the United States, it has not been solved in Canada; under no approximately parallel conditions has it been solved in any country. Even if we take the conditions in other countries where there are savage races, there is no other savage race on the same level as the North American Indian. He is in a class by himself and has a persistence of character not possessed by any other race in the world. Having to deal then with such a problem the government of Canada some twenty years ago adopted a certain principle. That principle has been worked to faithfully and well but the event has shown that the principle was not the correct one to furnish a solution. I am not here to say that it was not perhaps the best that could be adopted but it did not give the solution that we hoped for, and I am with my hon. friend in believing that the time has come for us to reconsider our position, if that is not too much to say, and see what better can be done. It is perfectly clear that it is not well advised to occupy the time of the young Indian in learning a trade in which he will never have an opportunity to engage. Having arrived at that idea we are more and more applying education to the land and educating the young men for work upon the land and so far as we have gone in that it seems to me to be the right line. The results achieved tend to show that this work is best suited to the character of the Indian. He has an independence of character that does not allow him to submit to the same dictation, direction and conditions that other races of men will submit to, and