

Supply—Justice

I do not think the remaining part of that paragraph is relevant but the next paragraph states:

If offensive words are spoken in Committee, which are taken down, the House only, and not the Committee, can take notice of them. The Committee therefore reports progress and asks leave to sit again; the Chairman reports the words used to the Speaker who says: 'It has been reported to the House that the hon. member for . . . has used the following words: . . . Has the honourable member anything to say in explanation or retraction of these words?'

I submit to you, therefore, that if the President of the Privy Council persists in his refusal to withdraw the offensive words then you have no option but to report the words to Mr. Speaker and the house shall then determine what action shall be taken to deal with the refusal to withdraw the charge made by the President of the Privy Council. If on the other hand he withdraws them here this matter is disposed of and there will be nothing to report to the house.

I trust that the President of the Privy Council will recognize that he is in serious breach of the rules, that he has made a personal attack on another member, and that in the interests of continuing the dignity and functions of this house he will withdraw.

Mr. Churchill: If he does not withdraw he should be named.

[*Translation*]

Mr. Trudeau: Mr. Chairman, far be it from me to take it upon myself to give you advice with regard to the application of the rules, but the facts may bear clarification.

There may be a slight translation problem here. The words "liar" and "perjury" were not spoken by the hon. minister. He did say that if the word "liar" was unparliamentary, he would withdraw it. He stated very clearly that the hon. member for Yukon (Mr. Nielsen) had twice said something which was not true.

An hon. Member: Under oath.

[*English*]

Some hon. Members: Oh, oh.

Mr. Trudeau: I am just trying to get the facts straight.

An hon. Member: What a silly man. Go back to the stables.

Mr. Trudeau: The minister may well say that it is snowing outside but I would not call him a liar if I went out and saw it was not snowing. I would say that he was stating

[Mr. Fulton.]

something that did not conform with the truth. That does not mean he is telling a lie. The word "perjury" was heard from the other side of the house, not from this side. I am not debating this point of order; I am just stating a fact.

Mr. Lewis: Mr. Chairman, I want to say something on this point which goes in my respectful submission a little beyond the mere point of order, important as it is. Last night we heard the house leader appeal to members of the committee because he had to get the estimates through in order to pay the salaries of the employees of the government. In my respectful submission I submit to the President of the Privy Council that it is a provocation to this committee to do as he has done. His behaviour is entirely improper for a minister of the Crown and it is contrary to the express demands of the house leader to make an interjection while another member is speaking which constitutes an attack on a member of this house that is bound to delay the passage of these estimates indefinitely.

Some hon. Members: Hear, hear.

Mr. Lewis: I therefore, if you will allow me to complete one sentence, appeal to the President of the Privy Council to do the right thing by the government, by the employees of the government and by this committee and withdraw his remarks.

Some hon. Members: Hear, hear.

Mr. Diefenbaker: Mr. Chairman, on the point of order, I call on the President of the Privy Council to withdraw his words. This house cannot operate if any member is allowed to use language that can only imply the commission of a criminal offence. His statement must be unequivocally withdrawn. If it is not, I ask you to report progress and we will then ask the Speaker to take the proper course, namely, to name the hon. gentleman.

Some hon. Members: Hear, hear.

[*Translation*]

Mr. Favreau: Mr. Chairman, I think it is unfair, not only for myself, but also for the hon. member for Yukon, to impute to me words that I have not said.

As the hon. member for Mount Royal (Mr. Trudeau) said a moment ago, it is on the other side of the house that certain words were said.

I am imputed words which would imply that the member for Yukon deliberately intended not to speak the truth when he testified.