

paid forty per cent of the cost of the Toronto-Hamilton highway. The city has contributed to the operations of the York highways commission, which has built a magnificent highways system of fifteen miles in the Toronto area, and which now should be revised as only enabling and assumed by the province.

Mr. R. R. KNIGHT (Saskatoon City): Mr. Speaker, I had not intended entering the debate on housing, nor do I presume to be able to tell the minister anything about it. I do enter the debate, however, to take issue with the right hon. gentleman in respect of certain statements he made last night, and which, incidentally, he did not substantiate. I should hope he might consider substantiating them today.

I shall now proceed to give the other side of the picture, and shall refer to certain community enterprises which have been entered into jointly. I presume the minister would describe them as subsidized enterprises. They have been entered into jointly by the province of Saskatchewan with the assistance of the federal government.

The minister made certain statements about this housing and its success, or lack of success, when he spoke last night. I presume he was referring to certain community apartments which were built or remodeled in my own city of Saskatoon, and also in the cities of Regina and North Battleford, and other places in the province.

At page 4178 of *Hansard* the minister said, in connection with this subsidized housing:

The government has considered subsidized housing. It has built subsidized houses—

And then he goes on to give an illustration. Speaking of this housing project, he said:

The management of the buildings was left to the province of Saskatchewan and the rentals collected are the property of the government of Saskatchewan. That would be an excellent place for a socialist government, which gives lip service—

And I would rather he had left out the word "lip".

—to subsidized housing, to practise a little of what it preaches. What are the facts?

Well, sir, I propose to give the facts on one side, and the minister, if he cares to, may give the facts on the other. The quotation goes on:

Rentals for the housing.—

And it is these lines to which I take exception particularly:

—largely paid for by the federal government, operated by the socialist provincial government, are somewhat higher than in corresponding localities in the rest of Canada. That is a clear indication that our socialist friends love to give lip service—

And there, quite properly, the minister was interrupted by vociferous objections from certain representatives of this group with such expressions as, "Give the figures". Then the minister said, "I know the figures" and again, "I know the facts". The minister may have them, but he did not give them. Therefore I should like to give certain of the facts on the other side of the argument.

Shortly after that, the minister said:

We know all about subsidized housing. The difficulty with subsidized housing is that it does not build any more houses.

I shall not go into that general argument; but I will say that these particular houses did give shelter to a great many people all of whom, I believe, were veterans of the last war. While I have not the figures for other cities—although I believe they are comparable—I know that in my own city of Saskatoon 185 family suites were provided. There are 370 adults living in those community apartments. They have been organized co-operatively, and govern themselves. They have an elected council. There is a communal dining hall and cafeteria providing meals for the residents. There are 125 small children, none of whom I believe has yet attained school age—although I am not sure of that statement. There is a supervising nursery provided for the children, and they also receive weekly medical health check-ups.

I would bring particularly to the minister's attention the fact that the rentals for these apartments range from \$15 to \$35 a month.

Mr. HOWE: That is the highest return for an investment of anything I know of.

Mr. KNIGHT: I presume there are other comparable communities in the cities of North Battleford and Regina. I should like to give what might be called personal testimony to this sort of thing, because we have the evidence of my hon. friend and colleague, the member for Melfort (Mr. Wright), with respect to his son, a returned soldier who is married and who has one child. Those people lived at this apartment in Saskatoon, which is known as community apartment No. 7.

By the way, I should explain that these houses are reconverted from air force buildings brought in from air force field No. 4. This man and his wife, who lived at the apartment, paid \$20 a month rent—and I would ask the house to note that that amount covered heat and light. They paid \$42 a month for the board of the three of them—I suppose the board of the child would not be costly. In any event, the sum total for those three people, including laundry service, light, heat,